

Volume 10, Number 4, 2022, Pages 1657–1667 Journal Homepage: https://journals.internationalrasd.org/index.php/pjhss PAKISTAN JOURNAL OF HUMANITIES AND SOCIAL SCIENCES (PJHSS)

ternational research association for sustainable developm

The Nexus of Learning Organization Practices and Subjective Performance of Employees: A Moderating Role of Employees' Engagement in the Energy Sector of Pakistan

Meher Bano¹, Asad Ali², Muhammad Asif³, Muhammad Sajid Tufail⁴

¹ Department of Management Sciences, HITEC University Taxila, Pakistan. Email: meher.bano@hitecuni.edu.pk

- ² Assistant Professor, Department of Management Science, The Islamia University of Bahawalpur, Bahawalnagar Campus, Pakistan. Email: asadali@iub.edu.pk
- ³ Senior Technical Officer (Process), Togh Gas Field, Dhok Hussain Plant Kohat, Oil and Gas Development Company Limited (OGDCL) Pakistan. Email: muhammad.asif@ogdcl.com
- ⁴ Lecturer, Institute of Management Sciences, Bahauddin Zakariya University, Multan, Pakistan.
- Email: sajidtufail@bzu.edu.pk

ARTICLE INFO

ABSTRACT

Article History:		This research aims to investigate the moderating effect of					
Received:	October 20, 2022	employee engagement on the association between learning					
Revised:	•	organization practices and employees' subjective performance in					
Accepted:	-	Pakistan's energy sector. Seven elements of Learning					
Available Online:		organization practices and employee perceptions of their success					
Keywords:	December 51, 2022	in developing financial markets are the focus of this research. We					
Learning Organiza	ation Practices	have selected a sample of 550 professionals through					
Subjective Perform		questionnaires. The snowball sampling technique was used					
Employee Engage		reach the maximum number of employees, because it assumed					
Energy Sector	inche	that the creativity of an economy depends upon the					
Funding:		innovativeness of an organization's employees. Out of 550, we					
	eceived no specific	received only 330 useable questionnaires for data analysis with a					
	inding agency in the	response rate of 78% in person and online resources. There are					
	al, or not-for-profit	also utilized Pearson correlation and direct regression analysis to					
sectors.		measure the relationship among variables. The impact of learning					
5000151		organizations on the subjective performance of employees is					
		found positive and highly significant in the energy sector of					
		Pakistan. Likewise, the moderating role of employees'					
		engagement is also noted as remarkable in the above					
		relationship. The study recommends that all seven dimensions of					
		learning organization practices should be considered by the					
		management of financial firms to enhance the subjective					
		performance of the employees in the energy sector of Pakistan.					
		Employees' engagement can accelerate the development of the					
		energy sector. The above-mentioned aspect of financial firms and					
		institutions of the developed countries, whereas the developing					
		countries are relatively less explored on the topic. It is worthwhile					
		to explore this relationship for the energy sector of Pakistan.					
		© 2022 The Authors, Published by iRASD. This is an Open Access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution Non-Commercial License					

Corresponding Author's Email: sajidtufail@bzu.edu.pk

1. Introduction

Learning organization is a contemporary concept in the emerging industrial era in which organization focuses on organizational as well as human resource development, it is the continuous transformation of employees where they continuously learn new concepts and adapt to changes. It is the collective effort of the organization and employees where they share knowledge, ideas, and philosophies (Reese, 2020). Employees enhance their capabilities by continuous learning and then produce the result they desire. It is a practice that works on collectivism, collaboration, dialogue, and communication do not only benefits the organization but also nourishes employee development. This term is not just limited to the business and the organizational world but is also especially important in the energy sector. A learning organizations can produce innovative professionals that produce instant transformation in the

energy world. The energy sector in developing countries must align with the global perspective for survival in a competitive world (Kools & George, 2020).

In this article, we are examining the relationship between the seven dimensions of learning organization practices, and the subjective performance of employees in the energy sector of Pakistan. In recent decade financial sector is growing rapidly with a key role in the economy, therefore such technologies which enhance performance is of excessive concern to the studies of the day. Learning is the key to success for any institution to tap the market and retain its performance goals. In the broad context of 'learning organization' it intricately links to vision sharing and moving in a single direction with constantly growing trends (Jalet, 2021). As information sharing among teams is considered a strategic approach, development is required at the personal, group, and organizational levels. The learning organization atmosphere in the financial sector helps to achieve more learning outcomes and will open a new dimension for innovative practices in competitive financial sectors.

Electricity, petroleum, and natural gas all play important roles in the energy sector and are interconnected. Due to a lack of investment in hydro, natural gas, and lignite, Pakistan is forced to rely on imported energy. Our lifestyle is highly dependent on electric appliances as the advancement in technologies has made us adapt and addict to this innovation, all of them need electricity to work. The unavailability of electric energy and load-shedding will create unpleasant lives. In Pakistan energy crisis is a major issue we are dealing with, because of the supply-demand gap, and technical and non-technical losses. By looking at the current scenario of the electric sector, this study intends to identify the factors that can increase the subjective performance of the employees so that they can come up with more innovative ideas in collaboration and teamwork, which all sums up in learning organization practices. Improved performance will make them overcome this energy crisis because Pakistan is blessed with a lot of power resources and fulfill its potential.

The energy sector of Pakistan is in trouble with several challenges because of lacking production. According to the ministry of energy of Pakistan, electricity generation capacity has increased by 11.5 percent from July-April 2022 to 41,557 MW from 37261 MW as compared to the same period last fiscal year July-April 2021. In Table 1, the fuel-wise installed capacity breakup is shown as per the data of July-April of FY2022.

	Installed (MW)	Percentage (%) Share		
Hydel*	10,251	24.7		
RLNG**	9,884	23.8		
RFO	5,958	14.3		
COAL	5,332	12.8		
Gas	3,536	8.5		
Nuclear***	3,647	8.8		
Wind****	1,985	4.8		
Solar	600	1.4		
Bagasse	364	0.9		
Total	41,557	100.0%		

Table 1: Fuel-wise Installed Capacity Breakup JULY-April FY2022

Source: Ministry of Energy, (Power Division)

The major problems arise due to commercial energy consumption and supply from different sources, including oil and petroleum, gas, electricity, and coal sources. The role of the energy sector is vital in accelerating nations' development and economic growth. These energy institutes are supposed to provide sufficient resources to energy users who are facing a shortage of it (Durusu-Ciftci, Ispir, & Yetkiner, 2017; Herwartz & Walle, 2014; Jedidia, Boujelbène, & Helali, 2014). When the energy sector is more advanced, there can be achieved the targets for economic growth with optimal allocation in a country. King and Levine (1993) using panel data from 80 countries, document strong and positive links between energy units and per capita output. In Table 2, sector-wise natural gas consumption in million cubic feet per day is plotted. This paper helps the energy sector to increase organizational performance because a leaning organization is the most critical and crucial factor in developing economies. Similarly, this study

also contributes to the literature in filling the literature gap because partial research conducted on this relationship in different organizations.

Sector	Gas Consumption	RLNG	Total	
Power	560	555	1,115	
Domestic	907	1	908	
Commercial	62	8	70	
Transport(CNG)	49	23	72	
Cement	1	0	1	
Fertilizer	684	51	735	
General Industry	439	225	664	
Total	2702	863	3565	

Table 2: Sector Wise Natural Gas Consumption in Million Cubic Feet Per Day (Mmcfd)

Source: Ministry of Energy(Petroleum Division)

We investigate an association of learning organization, practices, and subjective performance of employees moderated through the effect of employee engagement to meet the following formulated hypothesis:

H1: Learning organization practices have an association with the subjective performance of employees.

H2: Learning organization is associated with the group performance of employees.

H3: learning organizations hold a relationship with organizational performance.

H4: Employee Engagement moderates the relationship between learning, organization practices, and the performance of employees.

In Figure 1, the learning organization practices are designed as an independent variable and subjective performance as a dependent variable, employee engagement is acting as a moderator. Subjective performance is further divided into three more dimensions including individual, group, and subjective performance and learning organization practices have seven dimensions in the model.

Figure 1: Theoretical Framework



Employee engagement is a moderating factor between employee learning, organizational practices, and the subjective performance of workers in Pakistan's energy sector, however, this relationship has not been studied in the literature. Our goal is to investigate how adopting learning organization techniques might improve the perceptions of employees in these nations. In addition, we aim to use a modified model to assess how much of a role employee engagement has in influencing the aforementioned correlation.

In the first section, we presented the research problem, and in the second, we discussed the relevant literature on the topic. In the third segment, we'll look at the research methodology

and data. The research results are dissected in the fourth section. We have summarized the topic, suggested some policies, and admitted some of the study's flaws in the last section.

2. Review Of Literature

In this section, we review important concepts of research agenda, learning organization concept with seven dimensions, subjective performance, and employee engagement in the energy sector of different emerging economies.

2.1. Learning Organization Practices

Learning organizations nourish leaders and subordinates to meet the contemporary issues of their subjective domain. (Senge, 1990) explores that organizational success, work culture, and productivity are highly dependent on the individuals who are constantly in the learning process. Further, Aliazas and Elisa (2021) explore that a learning organization is a place where employees get a chance to grow, nourish and enhance their knowledge matching organizational and personal development needs, employees are more focused on their job and follow organizational vision enthusiastically (Aliazas & Elisa, 2021). Furthermore, it is observed that learning individuals are in relation to learning organizations (Iqbal & Ahmad, 2021). Infect, the primary motive of these organizations is that flexible, knowledgeable, and productive employees can succeed in the challengeable environments and can respond to change efficiently (Harman, 2019).

Learning organizations create ways for generating loyalty and tap up employees' commitment to learning at all organizational levels. Continuous learning leads to transformation; it helps the organization and employees to shape the future and members' innovative mindset. Peter Senge has divided learning into two categories; survival learning which is vital for employees and organizations, also known as "Adaptive Learning" and the second one in "Generative Learning". It is crucial in this changing technological era, it enhances the productivity and effectiveness of employees and boosts managerial, communication, and interpersonal skills (Advisors & Piro, 2021).

Therefore, a learning organization exists where an individual continuously learns to gain efficiency and effectiveness through developing modern skills and accurate capabilities. In short, learning is not only for survival but one's ability to create more and more as an industry leader. In line with the existing knowledge stream, learning organization can be discussed from the following seven dimensions:

• Creating Continuous Learning Opportunities:

Similarly, these opportunities improve individuals' ability to look beyond boundaries and work for proactivity. It taps confidence and individual's capacity to achieve desired effects (Rode, Huang, & Schroeder, 2022).

• Promotion of Inquiry and Dialogue

This specific aspect involves communication, knowledge sharing, intuition, and experiences. It helps employees to develop acceptance towards knowledge sharing and ideas coming from teammates, and enhances the analytical skills of employees using institution and past experiences. Moreover, it advances the communication skills of employees that enable them to work on personal and organizational growth (Mazhar & Ch, 2021).

Encouraging Collaboration and Team Learning

Effective collaboration is a particularly significant aspect, and it is more probable in decentralized organizations. Likewise, workplace culture is to be determined by how individuals connect to construct teams and succeed. Further, teams are being incorporated by organizations on various levels and channels to continue capacity to work successfully. People get a chance to learn collaboratively through teams. Furthermore, it helps the organization in achieving common goals by working in teams (Mazhar & Ch, 2021).

Establishment of a System to Capture and Shared Learning

Marsick and Watkins (1997) document that learning organization practices generate intangible assets for an organization that they can use in the future for times of employee

turnover and environmental changes. This provides a secured pathway that boosts employee morale in times of drastic changes. It is emphasized designing organizational systems in a way where individuals could get continuous training and then share essential concepts among teams (Levitt & March, 1988; Marsick & Watkins, 1997; Pokharel & Dudley, 2010). In addition to this one, a system of shared learning is necessary for creating and then maintaining this information for the improvement of organizational performance(Agyabeng-Mensah, Tang, Afum, Baah, & Dacosta, 2021).

• Toward a Collective Empower Vision

Organizational structure is significant in any firm in the modern world. Argote (2012) suggests that a centralized and firm structure provides fewer chances of growth and communication; eventually, it reduces efficiency and creates high knowledge-sharing barriers where employees fear interacting with each other. On other hand, we observe that a flexible structure has more chances of growth, diversity, and expansion. Employees turn out to be more committed and productive. Further, collective vision helps organizations in learning processes, uniting them to achieve organizational goals with firm determination.

• Connecting the Organization to its Environment

The most difficult phase in the organization setup is coping with the changing environment and then surviving with success (Mariano, 2022). The longer an organization takes to identify changes in the environment there are fewer chances for it to strengthen its position in the business world) Hosseini and Haghighi Shirazi (2021) Garvin (1993) and Jiwen Song, Tsui, and Law (2009) have documented that there is a need to share learning to enhance the capacity for survival organization.

Strategic Leadership

Barney and Zajac (1994) and Peteraf (1993) it is very crucial in playing a strategic role in the organization by relocating organizational resources and making the best use of employee capabilities in response to the dynamic business environment (Marsick & Watkins, 1997; Porter & Kramer, 2006; Weldy, 2009). Organizational performance can be enhanced by the strategic use of rituals, restrictions, symbols, and rewards (Carter & Greer, 2013).

2.2. Subjective Performance

Mackie and Wong (2008) have defined organizational performance as "the effectiveness and efficiency of the organization in achieving its objectives". Performance determines the survival and success of an organization. In other words, an organization depends upon employee performance. Carter and Greer (2013) have shown performance on three distinct levels i-e individual, team, and organizational performance. It is an essential element in industrial and in organizational psychology, it reflects employees' behavior, action, and commitment toward the organization which then determines the accomplishment of the aims and objectives. Fehrenbacher, Schulz, and Rotaru (2018) explore that subjective performance influences by the number of factors that includes work flexibility, job security, job satisfaction, and among all Learning organizational practices. As a result, employees feel accomplished when they work in an environment that focuses on their personal development and motivates them to adapt to changes.

In this contemporary era, the organization thrives to achieve success and sustainability through high productivity and employee performance, finding ways to grasp market share (Hassan, Azmat, Sarwar, Adil, & Gillani, 2020). They are nowadays focusing on creating a high work culture in team learning and collaboration, which promotes a decentralized and empowered space in which candidates achieve organizational as well as career goals as well. Infect, subjective performance increases when every individual in the organization shares the organizational vision systematically, and sense changes in the business world. Hence, they come with efficient inquiry and dialogue with each other.

2.3 Employee Engagement

According to the definition of engagement developed by Kahn (1990), it is the coordination of one's professional life and public assertion i.e., 'preferred self' in job behaviors. It is defined as a positive, fulfilling, and dedicated work mind where an employee is persistent in the job, and it is not related to any specific project or situation it covers all aspects of work 1661

culture. Employee engagement is individuals' involvement and satisfaction towards work, and he/she is ready to achieve organizational objectives matching the vision. It is a long-lasting state of mind where employees are motivated and cherished to work any time and accompanied by stimulating, proud and enduring experiences(Sun & Bunchapattanasakda, 2019). Engagement is not only related to individuals' cognitive abilities, but it also includes emotions and behaviors as well, studies show that highly engaged employees are more loyal, committed, productive, and loyal to the organization. It is an energy that is reflected in employees' performance in individual and group tasks (De-la-Calle-Durán & Rodríguez-Sánchez, 2021).

Employee engagement has been categorized into three types and dimensions that include work value, organizational commitment and recognition, and task engagement. Types of engagement encompass trait, behavioral engagement, and psychological state engagement. It enables one to work in an initiative-taking manner with a focus, on activating, and positive outcome (Rasool, Wang, Tang, Saeed, & Iqbal, 2021). There is a wide range of theories explaining employee engagement but the most used is Need-Satisfaction, introduced by Kahn (1990). An individual is more likely to be involved when psychological needs are satisfied. Need for meaningfulness, which refers to the positive feedback and returns on investment when the employee fulfills their self-role. Need for safety and availability, which ensures growth and empowerment without fear of negative consequences (Lemon & Boman, 2022). An organization that does not meet the desired need will bring up demotivated and less involved employees, individuals will pull back and will be less committed to the roles. Social exchange theory also favors employee engagement as a transaction between the organization and employees, where organizations provide empowerment, learning, and social rewards in return for loyalty, commitment, involvement, performance, and loyalty (Nagpal, 2022).

The engagement has three types of energies influencing job performance. First, physical energies that are high in relation to behaviors that lead to the achievement of organizational goals at amplified levels Kahn (1990) and because people's performance in their responsibilities at work is largely contingent on the norms of conduct established by their peers (Katz & Kahn, 1978). Second is cognitive the energy of employees which enables them to understand their work roles properly, and incorporate dedication and arduous work in their achieving organizational goals. Cognitive energies develop a clear and better understanding of organizational identity and work attitude (Kahn, 1990). An increase in cognitive investments will eventually increase performance. Finally, investments in emotional energy into work goals will contribute to the performance of the organization in multiple ways. Those who will invest in emotional energy which eventually leads to increased performance because of effective relations among co-workers in the hunt for organizational goals (Ashforth & Humphrey, 1995). It will also help in meeting the emotional needs of their work roles (Kahn, 1990).

Our review of the literature revealed no research investigating the link between learning organization methods and employees' subjective performance, mediated by employee engagement, in Pakistan's energy sector. The subjective performance of employees is impacted by all seven elements of learning organization activities. Yet, no single study has thus far attempted to investigate this question in detail inside the energy industry. We add to the literature by investigating how learning organization strategies affect employees' perceptions of their performance. We also investigate the level of employee participation in Pakistan's energy industry as the moderator.

3. Research Design

To examine the moderating influence of employee engagement in the relationship between learning organization practices and employees' subjective performance in Pakistan's energy sector, we have selected a sample of 550 professionals through questionnaires. The snowball sampling technique was used to reach the maximum number of employees, because it assumed that the creativity of an economy depends upon the innovativeness of an organization's employees. Out of 550, we received only 330 useable questionnaires for data analysis with a response rate of 78% in person and online resources.

We consulted the literature to obtain a reliable measurement, by using the tools that were already validated and compared in earlier literature. There were 34 statements and some

additional questions about demographics and work experience in the final version of the questionnaire. As mentioned earlier the questionnaire was adopted. The questionnaire contained four sections. The first section contains the questions and statements related to the demographics and works background of the subject. The second section was containing questions 1 to 21 related to Human Learning Organization Practices. The questions were designed using the Dimensions of Learning Organization Questionnaire (DLOQ). (Marsick & Watkins, 1997) developed DLOQ as having seven dimensions Continuous learning (CL), Team learning and collaboration (TLC), Embedded systems (ES), Empowerment (EMP), Systems connections (SC), Strategic leadership (SL) and Dialogue and inquiry (DI), while each dimension contains three questions. DLOQ has been validated and used in various research settings in various countries (Jamali, Sidani, & Zouein, 2009; Ya-Hui Lien, Yu-Yuan Hung, Yang, & Li, 2006; Yang, Watkins, & Marsick, 2004; Zhang, Zhang, & Yang, 2004).

The third section was related to Subjective Performance (SP) containing 10 questions. The questions were designed following Learning Organization Practices that were aimed at seeking the engagement of employees on Subjective Performance in our selected organizations. It has measured 3 dimensions rather levels of subjective performance i.e., Individual Level Performance (ILP) having 3 questions from ILP1 to ILP3, Group Level Performance (GLP) having 3 questions from GLP1 to GLP3, and finally, Organization Level Performance (OLP) having 4 questions from OLP1 to OLP4.

The fourth section of the questionnaire was measuring our moderating variable Employee Engagements containing four questions developed by (Medlin & Green, 2009). Various researchers have used it in various research settings See, for example, (Bakken & Torp, 2012; Rich, Lepine, & Crawford, 2010; Schaufeli, Bakker, & Salanova, 2006).

4. **Empirical Analysis**

In Table 1, the values for the descriptive mean and standard deviations of the study are mentioned with variables and sample demographics. It was found that males have a higher ratio than females among the respondents and 150 belong to the the age group of 26-30 and most of them are middle-level employees with a frequency of 125. The maximum education level observed is graduation with a frequency of 135.

Gender		Age		Job level		Education	
	F		F		F		F
Male	221	15-20	16	Top Level	75	Graduation	135
Female	109	21-25	40	Middle Level	125	Masters	122
		26-30	150	Lower Level	80	MS	40
		31-35	65	Non-Managerial	50	Other	33
		>36	64				
Total	330		330		330		330

Table 1 Descriptive Statistics

Correlation Analysis of Variables 4.1.

Correlation analysis shows the interdependency of variables like how much the dependent

Table 2: Pearson Correlation Analysis of Variables					
Independent Variable	Dependent Variable				
	AVG LO	AVG SP	AVG EE		
LO Pearson correlation	1	.591**	.624**		
sig (2-tailed) N		.000	.000		
	100	100	100		
SP Pearson correlation	.591**	1	.571**		
sig (2-tailed) N	.000		.000		
	100	101	101		
EE Pearson correlation	.624**	.571**	1		
sig (2-tailed) N	.000	.000			
	100	.101	101		

1 - 4 2 - - -

variable is correlated with the independent variable. Pearson's correlation analysis is done to investigate the relationship between the research variables which is explained in Table 2. It mentions the Pearson correlation analysis of variables. Correlation analysis shows the interdependency of variables like how much the dependent variable is correlated with the independent variable.

Correlation analysis shows a strong link between learning organization activities and employees' perceptions of their performance. Employee engagement is also evident as a moderating factor between learning organization strategies and employees' perceptions of their performance. Learning organization practices has a significant and positive relationship with the subjective performance of employees which means that learning organization practices can increase the organizational performance of employees. Therefore, creating continuous learning opportunities provide effective planning, learning, and adapting to the new paradigms in the industries that would benefit employees, organizations, and economies. This result is in line with the findings of Aliazas and Elisa (2021), Iqbal and Ahmad (2021) and Harman (2019). Employee engagement is also significantly influencing the relationship which means that learning organizations will lead to increased performance in the energy markets of developing countries when employees are more engaged in their work roles. Hence, it will result in higher levels of employee well-being and loyalty to the organizations (See, for instance, (Marsick & Watkins, 1997; Pokharel & Dudley, 2010; Shah & Farrow, 2020).

4.2. Regression Analysis

A direct regression analysis between the independent and dependent variables is conducted with significant values. Yet, we have not introduced moderation in analysis and the results of the model are here presented in Table 3.

Variables	Coefficients	Significance	Model Specifications	
Constant	.921	.003	R ²	.350
Learning organization	.655	.000	R ² _{adj}	.345
			F Value	51.582
			Sig	0.000

Table 3: Regression Results without Moderation

Dependent Variable: Subjective Performance

There is shown regression analysis with the moderation of employee engagement in Table 4. We are observing significant results after introducing the moderation of employee engagement as well.

Variables	Coefficients	Significance	Model Specifications	
Constant	.672	.210	R ²	.378
Learning organization	.422	.000	R ² adj	.366
Employee engagement	.272	.007	F Value	24.056
LOXEE	.142	.025	Sig	0.000 ^b

Dependent Variable: Subjective Performance

The influence of learning organization methods on employees' perceived productivity is shown in Table 4 of the aforementioned regression analysis. The findings in Table 3 and Table 4 are consistent with existing literature (Carter & Greer, 2013; Marsick & Watkins, 1997; Triguero, Peña-Vinces, González-Rendon, & Sánchez-Apellaniz, 2012; Zhang et al., 2004). Accordingly, the model was statistically significant (F =24.056; p < 0.01); all the explanatory variables included in the model seem to have explained around 37 percent variance in the dependent variable (R² = 0.378; R²_{adjusted} = 0.366). A learning organization has a coefficient (β =.427; p≤0.01), and employee engagement has (β =.272;p≤0.01), all of them are having a significant effect on the subjective performance of employees in the energy sector of Pakistan. The results show that a learning organization has a significant and favorable effect on employee performance (r=0.422). It implies that a one-unit change in learning organization will bring 0.422% change in employees' performance in the energy markets of selected developing countries. Similarly,

we can say one-unit change in employees' engagement will affect the performance of an employee by 0.272 %. In the existing literature, we find employee engagement positively contributed to the employee's performance in Lemon and Boman (2022), Nagpal (2022), Rasool et al. (2021).

According to Pearson's correlation analysis, there is a favorable relationship between learning organization methods, subjective performance, and employee engagement in Pakistan's energy sector.

5. Conclusion

Among Pakistan's energy industry workers, there is a correlation between learning organization techniques and employees' perceptions of their performance. Further, employee engagement moderates this relationship on an individual, team, or organizational levels of the learning organization practices which proved a positive impact on the subjective performance of employees only when employees are engaged in their work roles and job tasks in the energy sector. However, the same association of variables is explored mostly in non-energy institutions. Overall, we have explored a positive relationship between learning organization practices and the subjective performance of employees and found a significant correlation between independent and dependent variables of financial institutions. Our regulatory authorities need to improve learning organization practices to improve the subjective performance of employees in the energy sector of Pakistan.

This research has many limitations as it was conducted in the energy sector where employees hide the information on basis of their interest. Therefore, the extracted results cannot be generalized. Future research is recommended to carry out in other industries, and different departments, and using job satisfaction, leadership, and financial incentives as a moderator in emerging the energy sector of other countries.

References

Advisors, S., & Piro, J. S. (2021). Organizational Mindfulness in Recognition Schools: Mindful Leadership Practices of Principals That Build High Reliability Learning Organizations. International e-Journal of Educational Studies, 5(7), 143-159.

- Advisors, S., & Piro, J. S. (2021). ORGANIZATIONAL MINDFULNESS IN RECOGNITION SCHOOLS: MINDFUL LEADERSHIP PRACTICES OF PRINCIPALS THAT BUILD HIGH RELIABILITY LEARNING ORGANIZATIONS.
- Agyabeng-Mensah, Y., Tang, L., Afum, E., Baah, C., & Dacosta, E. (2021). Organisational identity and circular economy: are inter and intra organisational learning, lean management and zero waste practices worth pursuing? *Sustainable Production and Consumption, 28*, 648-662. doi:<u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.spc.2021.06.018</u>
- Aliazas, V. M., & Elisa, N. (2021). Work Culture and Learning Organization Practices in Promoting Work Productivity among Public Elementary School Teachers. *International Journal of Educational Management and Development Studies*, 2(3), 39-60.
- Argote, L. (2012). Organizational learning: Creating, retaining and transferring knowledge: Springer Science & Business Media.
- Ashforth, B. E., & Humphrey, R. H. (1995). Emotion in the workplace: A reappraisal. *Human* relations, 48(2), 97-125. doi:<u>https://doi.org/10.1177/001872679504800201</u>
- Bakken, B., & Torp, S. (2012). Work engagement and health among industrial workers. *Scandinavian Journal of Organizational Psychology*, 4(1), 4-20.
- Barney, J. B., & Zajac, E. J. (1994). Competitive organizational behavior: toward an organizationally-based theory of competitive advantage. *Strategic management journal*, 15(S1), 5-9. doi:<u>https://doi.org/10.1002/smj.4250150902</u>
- Carter, S. M., & Greer, C. R. (2013). Strategic leadership: Values, styles, and organizational performance. *Journal of Leadership & Organizational Studies, 20*(4), 375-393. doi:https://doi.org/10.1177/1548051812471724
- De-la-Calle-Durán, M.-C., & Rodríguez-Sánchez, J.-L. (2021). Employee engagement and wellbeing in times of COVID-19: A proposal of the 5Cs model. *International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health*, *18*(10), 5470. doi:<u>https://doi.org/10.3390/ijerph18105470</u>

- Durusu-Ciftci, D., Ispir, M. S., & Yetkiner, H. (2017). Financial development and economic growth: Some theory and more evidence. *Journal of Policy Modeling*, *39*(2), 290-306. doi:<u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpolmod.2016.08.001</u>
- Fehrenbacher, D. D., Schulz, A. K.-D., & Rotaru, K. (2018). The moderating role of decision mode in subjective performance evaluation. *Management Accounting Research*, 41, 1-10. doi:https://doi.org/10.1016/j.mar.2018.03.001
- Garvin, P. L. (1993). A conceptual framework for the study of language standardization. doi:<u>https://doi.org/10.1515/ijsl.1993.100-101.37</u>
- Harman, C. A. W. (2019). HOW WE LEARN: MEASURING LEARNING PRACTICES FOR INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY PROFESSIONALS. University of Georgia,
- Hassan, M., Azmat, U., Sarwar, S., Adil, I. H., & Gillani, S. H. M. (2020). Impact of job satisfaction, job stress and motivation on job performance: a case from private universities of karachi. *Kuwait Chapter of the Arabian Journal of Business and Management Review*, 9(2), 31-41.
- Herwartz, H., & Walle, Y. M. (2014). Openness and the finance-growth nexus. *Journal of Banking* & *Finance, 48*, 235-247. doi:<u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.econmod.2013.11.029</u>
- Hosseini, S., & Haghighi Shirazi, Z. R. (2021). Towards teacher innovative work behavior: A conceptual model. *Cogent Education, 8*(1), 1869364. doi:https://doi.org/10.1080/2331186X.2020.1869364
- Iqbal, Q., & Ahmad, N. H. (2021). Sustainable development: The colors of sustainable leadership in learning organization. *Sustainable Development, 29*(1), 108-119. doi:<u>https://doi.org/10.1002/sd.2135</u>
- Jalet, S. (2021). Designing conceptual framework for a study on the relationship of distributive leadership practices and learning organizations to teachers' work performance: Pembinaan kerangka konseptual kajian mengenai hubungan amalan kepimpinan distributif dan organisasi pembelajaran terhadap prestasi kerja guru. *Management Research Journal, 10*(1), 108-122. doi:<u>https://doi.org/10.37134/mrj.vol10.1.8.2021</u>
- Jamali, D., Sidani, Y., & Zouein, C. (2009). The learning organization: tracking progress in a developing country: a comparative analysis using the DLOQ. *The Learning Organization*. doi:<u>https://doi.org/10.1108/09696470910939198</u>
- Jedidia, K. B., Boujelbène, T., & Helali, K. (2014). Financial development and economic growth: New evidence from Tunisia. *Journal of Policy Modeling*, *36*(5), 883-898. doi:<u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpolmod.2014.08.002</u>
- Jiwen Song, L., Tsui, A. S., & Law, K. S. (2009). Unpacking employee responses to organizational exchange mechanisms: The role of social and economic exchange perceptions. *Journal of Management*, *35*(1), 56-93. doi:<u>https://doi.org/10.1177/0149206308321544</u>
- Kahn, W. A. (1990). Psychological conditions of personal engagement and disengagement at work. *Academy of management journal, 33*(4), 692-724. doi:<u>https://doi.org/10.5465/256287</u>
- Katz, D., & Kahn, R. L. (1978). Organizations and the system concept. *Classics of organization theory*, *80*, 480.
- King, R. G., & Levine, R. (1993). Finance and growth: Schumpeter might be right. *The quarterly journal of economics, 108*(3), 717-737. doi: <u>https://doi.org/10.2307/2118406</u>
- Kools, M., & George, B. (2020). Debate: The learning organization—a key construct linking strategic planning and strategic management. *Public Money & Management, 40*(4), 262-264. doi:<u>https://doi.org/10.1080/09540962.2020.1727112</u>
- Lemon, L. L., & Boman, C. D. (2022). Ethics of care in action: Overview of holistic framework with application to employee engagement. *Public Relations Review*, *48*(4), 102232. doi:<u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.pubrev.2022.102232</u>
- Levitt, B., & March, J. G. (1988). Organizational learning. *Annual review of sociology*, 14(1), 319-338. doi:<u>https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev.so.14.080188.001535</u>
- Mariano, S. (2022). Actionable knowledge and creative projects: Antecedents, practices, and outcomes. *Knowledge Management Research & Practice*, 1-12. doi:

https://doi.org/10.1080/14778238.2022.2067493

Marsick, V., & Watkins, K. (1997). Organizational learning. *What works: Assessment, development, and measurement*, 65-86.

- Mazhar, S., & Ch, A. H. (2021). The Relationship between Knowledge Management Practices and Team Learning at Higher Education Institutions in Pakistan. *Indian Journal of Economics and Business*, 20(4).
- Medlin, B., & Green, K. (2009). Developing a performance management system at the community outreach agency: a case study. *Journal of the International Academy for Case Studies*, 15(1), 101.
- Nagpal, P. (2022). Organizational Commitment as An Outcome of Employee Engagement: A Social Exchange Perceptive Using a SEM Model. *International Journal of Biology, Pharmacy* and Allied Sciences, 11(1), 72-86. doi:https://doi.org/10.31032/IJBPAS/2022/11.1.1008
- Peteraf, M. A. (1993). The cornerstones of competitive advantage: a resource-based view. *Strategic management journal, 14*(3), 179-191. doi:https://doi.org/10.1002/smj.4250140303
- Pokharel, M. P., & Dudley, L. S. (2010). Organizational learning: modeling an intervention in a foster care system. *International Journal of Organization Theory & Behavior*, 13(4), 465-499. doi: <u>https://doi.org/10.1108/IJOTB-13-04-2010-B001</u>
- Porter, M. E., & Kramer, M. R. (2006). The link between competitive advantage and corporate social responsibility. *Harvard business review*, *84*(12), 78-92.
- Rasool, S. F., Wang, M., Tang, M., Saeed, A., & Iqbal, J. (2021). How toxic workplace environment effects the employee engagement: The mediating role of organizational support and employee wellbeing. *International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health, 18*(5), 2294. doi:<u>https://doi.org/10.3390/ijerph18052294</u>
- Reese, S. (2020). Taking the learning organization mainstream and beyond the organizational level: an interview with Peter Senge. *The Learning Organization*, 27(1), 6-16. doi:<u>https://doi.org/10.1108/TLO-09-2019-0136</u>
- Rich, B. L., Lepine, J. A., & Crawford, E. R. (2010). Job engagement: Antecedents and effects on job performance. *Academy of management journal*, 53(3), 617-635. doi:<u>https://doi.org/10.5465/amj.2010.51468988</u>
- Rode, J. C., Huang, X., & Schroeder, R. G. (2022). Human resources practices and continuous improvement and learning across cultures. *Journal of International Management, 28*(4), 100972. doi:<u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.intman.2022.100972</u>
- Schaufeli, W. B., Bakker, A. B., & Salanova, M. (2006). The measurement of work engagement with a short questionnaire: A cross-national study. *Educational and psychological measurement*, 66(4), 701-716. doi:<u>https://doi.org/10.1177/0013164405282471</u>
- Senge, P. (1990). Peter Senge and the learning organization. Rcuperado de.
- Shah, S. G. S., & Farrow, A. (2020). A commentary on "World Health Organization declares global emergency: A review of the 2019 novel Coronavirus (COVID-19)". International journal of surgery (London, England), 76, 128.
- Sun, L., & Bunchapattanasakda, C. (2019). Employee engagement: A literature review. *International Journal of Human Resource Studies*, 9(1), 63-80.
- Triguero, R., Peña-Vinces, J., González-Rendon, M., & Sánchez-Apellaniz, M. (2012). Human resource management practices aimed at seeking the commitment of employees on financial and non-financial (subjective) performance in Spanish firms: An empirical contribution. *Journal of Economics, Finance & Administrative Science, 17*(32).
- Weldy, T. G. (2009). Learning organization and transfer: strategies for improving performance. *The Learning Organization*. doi:<u>https://doi.org/10.1108/09696470910927678</u>
- Ya-Hui Lien, B., Yu-Yuan Hung, R., Yang, B., & Li, M. (2006). Is the learning organization a valid concept in the Taiwanese context? *International Journal of Manpower, 27*(2), 189-203. doi: <u>https://doi.org/10.1108/01437720610666209</u>
- Yang, B., Watkins, K. E., & Marsick, V. J. (2004). The construct of the learning organization: Dimensions, measurement, and validation. *Human resource development quarterly*, 15(1), 31-55. doi:<u>https://doi.org/10.1002/hrdq.1086</u>
- Zhang, D., Zhang, Z., & Yang, B. (2004). Learning organization in mainland China: empirical research on its application to Chinese state-owned enterprises. *International Journal of training and development*, 8(4), 258-273. doi:<u>https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1360-3736.2004.00213.x</u>