



Repression and Resistance in Fatima Bhutto's *The Shadow of the Crescent Moon*

Mohiodin Farhan¹, Shazmeen Nawaz², Maria Najam³

¹ Lecturer, Department of English, University of Education, Lahore (Faisalabad Campus), Pakistan.
Email: mohiodinfarhan@ue.edu.pk

² Lecturer, Department of English, Government Associate College for Women, Quaidabad, Pakistan.
Email: shazmeennawaz@hotmail.com

³ Lecturer, department of English, Government Associate College for Women, Katha Saghral, Pakistan.
Email: mariya.najam@yahoo.com

ARTICLE INFO

Article History:

Received: April 22, 2023
Revised: June 06, 2023
Accepted: June 06, 2023
Available Online: June 09, 2023

Keywords:

Marginalization
State Apparatus
Freedom
FATA
Ideology
State Narrative

Funding:

This research received no specific grant from any funding agency in the public, commercial, or not-for-profit sectors.

ABSTRACT

This paper aims at discovering factors that play vital role in the alienation and marginalization of masses by 'State Apparatuses' that not only compel them to show unwavering obedience to state but also force them to sacrifice their right to freedom and will. It will spotlight some modes in which suppressed people resist against state apparatuses in order to secure their freedom. The aim of this research is to provide a platform to those silent voices or lost groups which have never been represented in the state narratives. Discussing the socio-political scenario of Federally Administrated Tribal Area, this work speaks the unspeakable things via deconstructing the bitter facts about the particular region: Mir Ali. Bhutto's *The Shadow of the Crescent Moon* challenges the mainstream narratives where the third world nations either have no representation or a negative presentation. Giving the voice to the voiceless, Bhutto's fiction explicitly describes the narrative of the masses of FATA because, before that, we have only one dimension of narrative that is state's narrative. For useful exploration and analysis, the idea of 'repression and resistance' will be discussed with reference to Louis Althusser's 'Ideology of State Apparatus'. For this purpose the primary text shall be deconstructed at all levels.

© 2023 The Authors, Published by iRASD. This is an Open Access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution Non-Commercial License

Corresponding Author's Email: mohiodinfarhan@ue.edu.pk

1. Introduction

Fatima Bhutto's fiction manifests the impact of 'War on Terror' on the mundane life of a common man in the 'Third World' countries like Pakistan and Afghanistan. *The Shadow of the Crescent Moon* depicts reality through fictional details. In an interview to Gulf News, Fatima Bhutto argued that "the scenery or the description come from what I saw. So, though it is a fiction, *The Shadow of the Crescent Moon* is not a fake story." Federally Administrated Tribal Area, a region administered by federal government of Pakistan, stays at the margins of representation owing to the lack of rights and civil liberties. They are deprived of even the basic necessities of life and not plied with the fundamental rights. When dwellers of this region ask about their rights of freedom, they are assessed as traitors by the lens of state. This results in chaos and anarchy because both sides do not want to step back. As it happens, state is powerful and enjoys absolute authority to do anything. So, often state narratives continue to misrepresent the underprivileged and lower strata of society by either distorting their life experiences or presenting them as stereotypes.

In general, state repression may be seen as the use of force against individuals or groups to eradicate dissent or avert threats. However, it actually includes harassment, surveillance, arrests, tortures and mass killings. Thus, it is central to our everyday life even if we are not aware of it. There is a tendency to think of state repression in the context of ethnic/religious conflict but one should not limit this concept to conflict. The idea of state repression means to

exercise power and authority in cruel and unfair manners. Davenport (2007)¹ in his book, *State Repression and Political Order*, asserts, "State Repression" includes harassment, surveillance, spying, bans, arrests, torture, and mass killing by government agents or affiliates within their territorial jurisdiction" (14). Though the state ensures delusional allurements yet it thwarts freedom of expression or protest against its heinous activities, Davenport claims. Likewise, all these tactics are practiced by the state and the military to quell the natives of Mir Ali in *The Shadow of the Crescent Moon*. Davenport (2007), in another book entitled *State Repression and Domestic Democratic Peace*, states that, sometimes, government hires its own people to nip the evil in the bud. It is suggested that this is a clandestine way to exercise violence and repress people if they try to resist state's will. This situation has also been illustrated in Bhutto's fiction where a representative of state hires the service of a man to get any form of appraisal. Bhutto (2016), in *The Shadow of the Crescent Moon*, suggests that state does not act like a mother with the people of Mir Ali. She reflects that state uses many of its institutions such as army, police and judiciary to repress its people. In order to repress its people psychologically, state does not give them representation on political horizon. Their political representatives are chosen by state against their will. All such ways of repression and suppression that state uses against its masses construct a destructive path between state and its citizens.

According to Charles Darwin² (1859), "one, who has the power, has the right to survive. This is called survival of the fittest" (Evolutionary Theory). So, this world is based on the relationship of power. The eater-eaten relationship determines the course of life on earth. This is true both in the world of animals as well as human beings. The words 'values', 'culture' and 'humanity'- are all invented by man for appropriating the demonic acts of power and subjugation. Bhutto's *The Shadow of the Crescent Moon* challenges the conventional narratives where the third world nations either have no representation or a negative presentation. Giving the voice to the voiceless, Bhutto's fiction explicitly describes the narrative of the masses of FATA because before that, we have only one dimension of narrative that is state's narrative. Subsequently, the application of repression and resistance in '*The Shadow of the Crescent Moon*', to some extent, is based upon ground realities e.g. Battle of Mir Ali³, is closely related to the ideological position of writer. People of Mir Ali are specifically chosen by Fatima Bhutto because she, as a journalist, has done so much work upon the miseries and hapless life of this area. This is one of the unfortunate regions that was put at the back burner by every government of Pakistan either it was a dictatorial or democratic regime. Residents of this area have suffered more than anyone else in Pakistan due to the War on Terror.

Marxist theorist Althusser (1970) introduces a term 'State Apparatus' that is the sum of the institutions by which the ruling class maintains its economic dominance. He further presents two major concepts of his theory, one is 'Repressive State Apparatus' (denotes institutions like army, police, judiciary with cruel and violent acts whose function is to spread terror and viciousness), and another is 'Ideological State Apparatus' that denotes institutions like law, church, media, family, education and trade which are formally outside state control but which serve to transmit values of the state to interrogate those people affected by the them, maintains (Ferreter, 2006). Hence, *The Shadow of the Crescent Moon* deploys 'Repressive State Apparatus' to study 'repression' and 'Ideological State Apparatus' to survey 'resistance'. Like others, Fatima Bhutto's efforts, too, show that banishment on freedom and revocation of fundamental rights of people force them to oppose the state. Bhutto plies a platform to the suppressed people of FATA in ENGLISH fiction that is a very rare illustration in Pakistan. She gives narrative to the suppressed masses that are intentionally put down by force.

Bangash (2016)⁴ in his book, *The Frontier Tribal Belt, Genesis and Purpose under the Raj*, argues that Pakistani establishment always uses tribal people for its gains. The most callous use of the tribal areas was under General Zia when the tribal areas hosted foreign militants who used the area as a launching place against Afghanistan. This idea comes under the 'Ideological State Apparatus' that on realistic basis resulted in the devastation of life in tribal region. Like Bangash (2016) argument, Bhutto also describes the excessive usage of locals by military intelligence. Military man uses inhabitant as a spook and suppresses him ideologically to get the 'vested

¹ An American political professor

² An English Naturalist and Geologist and pioneer of science of evolution

³ A battle fought between Pakistan Army and Taliban in Mir Ali in 2007 in reality

⁴ A Pakistani scholar

interest of state' by putting aside the freedom of masses. So, both writers do agree on the same point. Ayesha Siddiqua⁵ (2007), in her book *Military Inc: Inside Pakistan's Military Economy*, says that Pakistan military wants to get its sole economic welfare devoid of any state's concern. Siddiqua-Agha (2007) uses the term "Milbus" that refers to "military capital that is used for the personal benefit of the military fraternity, especially the officer cadre, but is neither recorded nor considered a part of the defense budget" (2). She suggests that it is military that retains its secret funds. She also tells that army considers itself unanswerable to people due to its atrocities committed in Baluchistan. These points are almost relevant and support the argument of Fatima Bhutto that army is above any kind of accountability what it has done in FATA.

Anatol Liven⁶ (2011) in his book, *Pakistan: A Hard Country*, unveils the evils that exist inside the Pakistani elite. He states that how Western governments have coerced and bribed the Pakistani military into extensive wars against their own citizens; tens of thousands of Pakistanis have now died (the greatest toll yet of the "war on terror"⁷), and innumerable numbers have been displaced, in the backlash to the doomed western effort to exterminate a proper noun. And Pakistan is uttered with the words 'failing' or 'failed state'(Lieven, 2012)⁸. The facts mentioned, in *Pakistan: A hard country*, are all relevant with the ideas present in *The Shadow of the Crescent Moon*. Fatima Bhutto argues that military is supported by foreign armies like NATO⁹ and ISAF¹⁰. Additionally, news articles like "Countering Militancy in FATA, Governing Fate: the Big Debate, An option for FATA and Taliban exploiting grievances in Fata" reveal the pain of hapless people of FATA. All these articles not only advocate that the people of FATA must be given a proper platform in national mainstream but also are the chief exponents of the exploration of the suppressed people's narrative.

2. Historiography and Modus Vivendi of FATA

The Federally Administered Tribal Areas (FATA) is a semi-autonomous¹¹ tribal region in northwestern Pakistan. The Federally Administered Tribal Areas comprise seven tribal agencies and six frontier regions. This region is directly governed by Pakistan's federal government through a special set of laws called the Frontier Crimes Regulations¹² (FCR). The residents of FATA are Pashtun people who are all Muslims. Fata was conquered by Britishers in 19th century from Raja Ranjit Singh¹³. Although colonists never succeeded to curb the violence but this landscape gave them protection of Afghan insurgents. British Raj devised a rule, Frontier Crimes Regulations (FCR), to govern this area via local nobles. Britishers also, with the collaboration of local lords, formed Jirga system¹⁴ to solve the local problems. However, Frontier Crimes Regulations did ply discretionary powers to local nobles that resulted in the violation of fundamental rights of human beings. After 1947, FATA nobles declared this landscape as the part of Pakistan territory. Pakistan did not formulate any set of rules to govern FATA and relegated powers to local lords under the rules of FCR¹⁵. This results in an uncontrolled policy of Pakistani government over FATA region.

The total population of the Federally Administered Tribal Areas was estimated in 2000 to be about 3,341,070 people, or roughly 2% of Pakistan's population. Only 3.1% of the population resides in established townships. It is thus the most rural administrative unit in Pakistan. The cultural heritage of FATA is very rich in terms of hospitality, tribal arts and crafts, historical places, ethnic diversity and natural beauty¹⁶. The tribes are used to look after their own resources and solve local problems. They take collective action in support of economic and social activities such as, supporting each other on special occasions like death and marriage ceremonies, harvesting and threshing of crops, construction of *Hujra*¹⁷, mosque, buildings and cleaning of

⁵ Political writer of Pakistan

⁶ A British author

⁷ War launched by Western Power against Terrorism in the whole world

⁸ For further information see, Lieven 2012

⁹ North Treaty Atlantic Organization, a military organization

¹⁰ International Security Assistance Force, a military organization

¹¹ Acting independently to some degree

¹² It is special set of laws of Pakistan government that is applicable only in FATA, firstly advised by Britishers to control this region.

¹³ Founder of Sikh empire in Sub-Continent

¹⁴ A tradition assembly of elders to solve the issue according to established norms

¹⁵ For further information, see Nadeem 24

¹⁶ For further information see, Nadeem Shahid 21

¹⁷ A room for prayer in Pashtun culture

irrigation channels and protection from flood. *Jirga* and *Malki*¹⁸ systems are strong and powerful local institutions for the reconciliation and resolution of local disputes and even to punish those who violate the local rules and customs. If the dispute is of bigger nature between the tribes then the PA, MNA and Senators, *Maliks* and elders, sometimes from neighboring FRs/agencies also participate in the *jirga* to resolve the disputes.

FATA became the part of Pakistan in 1948. However, the government of Pakistan finally granted the Federally Administered Tribal Areas the long requested 'adult franchise' in 1996, under which every adult would have the right to vote for their own representatives in the Majlis-e-Shoora¹⁹. However, the Federally Administered Tribal Areas were not allowed to organize political parties and Islamic contestants were allowed to get vote to represent the Federally Administered Tribal Areas in the National Assembly in 1997 and 2002. That was the backdrop of FATA which bore the Islamic fanaticism in this terrain(Rehamn, 2015, April 10)²⁰. On governance horizon, this is identity-less because it is directly controlled by governor of Khyber pakhtunkhaw on behalf of president of Pakistan. This region does not come in the jurisdiction and purview of Apex court of Pakistan. However, all the daily life practices of Fata folks were undermined and went in wrong direction during Afghan-USSR war and Pakistan's indulgence in it. According to the United States Institute of Peace, "the character of the region underwent a shift at the beginning of Afghan-USSR War in the 1980s. This war called forth millions of Mujahedeen and thousands of espionages in this terrain."

People of FATA, from dawn to dusk, breathe under the looming threat of terrorism since 2001 as region provided sanctuaries to the terrorist organizations aftermath of 9/11 attack²¹. Twins Tower Attack that ensued the landing of USA and NATO force in Afghanistan changed the living style of this region. In 2001, the Tehrik-e-Taliban²² militants began entering into the region. In 2003, Taliban forces sheltered in the Federally Administered Tribal Areas began crossing the border into Afghanistan, attacking military and police. They began to conduct operations in Afghanistan against the USA forces. With back up support of the USA, Pakistan Armed Forces launched operation against the sanctuaries of Taliban but faced severe resistance. After two months, Pakistan army and Taliban had to sign a truce but it met with abortive success. In October 2007, Pakistan army conducted an operation in Mir Ali, North Waziristan. The Battle of Mir Ali was a bloody military engagement occurred between 7 October and 10 October 2007 and involved Taliban militants and Pakistani soldiers. Local witnesses assert that On 9 October, military aircraft struck "one or two places" near Mir Ali. Residents of Mir Ali enunciate that 50 people were killed, and it was a mix of civilians and militants killed when a bazaar was hit. On 10 October, thousands of tribesmen gathered in Epi ²³to bury 50 people killed when about one dozen explosions destroyed shops and homes, residents said. During the battle of Mir Ali, setting of *The Shadow of the Crescent Moon*, dozens of civilians faced ill-fated demise either from army or from Taliban. This is little reflection of the life of people of FATA who live under the looming threat of death (Adil 2009:1). In 2014, Pakistan Army, with its full capacity, launched Operation *Zarb-e-Azb*²⁴, in Fata, to eliminate the menace of terrorism. This clean-up operation compelled all the dwellers of Fata to leave their native homes. This act almost has destroyed the daily life of folks. Everything in FATA region has been devastated as the result of military operation. Folks of Fata are now homeless, jobless and penniless too. They do not have any clear future for themselves as well as for their off-springs. This is factual and historical truth of FATA region and its habitants.

In a news article 'An option for Fata'²⁵ published in Dawn²⁶, writer opines to solve the problems of this rocky region. According to him, the solution of Fata lies only in political hands, Army comes and kicks out the insurgents, and it is the core responsibility of political leadership to maintain grievances. He says that FATA's problems are due to its identity crisis too. He

¹⁸ This system was developed to strengthen the colonial administration in the region of FATA

¹⁹ Assembly of people's representatives

²⁰ Zia Rehman 1

²¹ Attack on World Trade Centre on 9 September, 2001

²² A militant organization in Pakistan

²³ A small village in Mir Ali

²⁴ A comprehensive military operation By Pakistan Army against terrorist

²⁵ By Rauf khattak

²⁶ An English newspaper

suggests that FATA should submerge into Khyber Pakhtunkhwa instead of under the flag of federation.

In *The Shadow of the Crescent Moon*, Bhutto describes the living style of the people of Mir Ali, a sub-division of North Waziristan. This town, as represented in novel, is worn-torn due to War on Terror. Local people do not know about their future, and also deprived of fundamental rights as well as basic facilities of life. They are not allowed to participate in politics and are kept away from national horizon. Narrator divulges the life of a down-trodden family. The very basic rule of leading life, here in Mir Ali, is to accept the atrocities of state and Taliban and to live like submissive human beings as Aman Erum²⁷ and his brother Sikander²⁸ do. Novel begins with the description of calamities in Mir Ali as "The clouds dip low over Mir Ali and, from a distance, the fog makes it seem as though tanks aren't there all" (Bhutto, 2016). Three brothers "live under the same roof- a home they share with their widowed mother, who occupies solitary room on ground floor, spending her days in the company of young maid who gives her medicine and homeopathic tonic" (Bhutto, 2016). Family is confined to a house and mother is not well and taking medicines on regular basis. Furthermore, life of three brothers, named as Aman Erum, Hayat and Sikander, is miserable and pathetic. Their lives are devoid of any freedom and self-expression. Aman Erum, the eldest one, leads his childhood days as heydays and always loves to see his beloved Samarra²⁹. Every summer, he goes to Chitral³⁰ with his father and uses to spend summer vacation there. These are the prosperous days of his life and he has fallen in love with Samara when he was in Chitral. "when he was eleven-year-old, the summer of an especially bountiful fishing trip, Aman Erum fell in love. She was twelve-year-old and he had never seen anyone so beautiful. Samarra" (Bhutto, 2016).

A twist comes in Aman Erum's life when Pakistan army enters in Mir Ali, North Waziristan, to eliminate terrorist and anti-state elements. Under such circumstances, Aman Erum's future seems shambolic. He does not want to spend his days in this troublesome region. Youth of this region is not allowed to get government jobs as "Army didn't want men from these parts" (Bhutto, 2016). By experiencing this, Aman Erum wants to leave Mir Ali for his better future. He wants to go USA for higher studies. He does apply for his study course but faces marginalization and double standard of authority because of his native region. In Islamabad³¹, Aman Erum has to bear the tirades of Punjabi bus driver because of his region. A driver lashes out as "Hundreds of *Jawans*-thousands- how many of our men have spilled their blood fighting you terrorists?" (Bhutto, 2016). This reflects the hapless aspect of life that Aman Erum, being a marginalized person, faces in his own country. Furthermore, he is entrapped in the tentacles of clandestine operatives and becomes espionage under the suzerainty of Colonel Tariq³². Hayat, younger one, follows the footstep of his father. His life is constant struggle against the oppressors.

Sikander and his spouse, Mina³³, as a couple, lead a life which is exceedingly suppressed by various elements of society. As a family, they face the barbaric acts of state and as a couple, a Shia couple; they suffer the inhumane activities of Taliban. Sikander is a doctor by profession and works in Hasan Faraz Hospital³⁴, a depiction of worn-torn health facilities to the people of Mir Ali. Sikander's wife, Mina, is a professor of psychology but she suffers in a trance after the assassination of his son, Zalan, who dies in an attack conducted by Taliban. Sikander and his wife also entrap in the vigorous question-answer session by Taliban leader. In a nutshell, this spouse accepts the rules and regulations of state and show obeisance to the implementations of state. They are the reflection of a marginalized couple in *The Shadow of the Crescent Moon*.

Fatima Bhutto also narrates another story, story of Samara's life. She is beautiful girl who lives in Mir Ali and establishes a group of insurgents after the disappearance of her father. Samara, as a female, leads a very tough and challenging life. Her lover, Aman Erum, acts as a spook and apprises to Colonel Tariq about her covert activities. She bears tortures at military covert cells but does not deviate from her commitment; freedom from Pakistani State. If seem

²⁷ A male character in novel

²⁸ A male character in novel

²⁹ A female character in novel that later handles a militant group

³⁰ An area located at Pak-Afghan border

³¹ Capital of Pakistan

³² A character in the novel who works for army via secret agency

³³ A female character in novel who suffers in psychological disorder

³⁴ A hospital described in novel

the life of people at societal level, one can dare say that people of FATA are always denounced by higher authorities from participating in national horizons of prosperity and progress. Everyone in Pakistan hates the people of Mir Ali such as "Most Pakistanis thought of Mir Ali with the same hostility they reserved for India or Bangladesh; insiders – traitors" (Bhutto, 2016). Pakistan state issues order. "The citizens of Mir Ali were not permitted by federal orders to gather in groups of three or more in any public space" (Bhutto, 2016). Daily life of people of Mir Ali is, mostly, controlled by religion and religious peers. In the very first chapter of *The shadow of the Crescent Moon*, the narrator asserts that "religion crept into the town's rocky terrain like the wild flowers that grew quietly where ought not to have grown, you chose your mosque carefully" (Bhutto, 2016). Shia community of Mir Ali suffers due to Sunni³⁵ extremism as Bhutto jots down "By drugged-up Saudi pubescent trained in the exact extermination of Shia," and more, "no it's not just Saudis, sometimes there is politics behind it, not GOD." (Bhutto, 2016).

Fatima Bhutto explicitly expresses the local *modus Vivendi* of people of Mir Ali. She impartially exposes the discriminative and biased behavior chosen by government to deal with the people of region FATA. Althusser claims that state apparatus, in fact, consists of two overlapping but distinct set of institutions. On the one hand, he argues that it consists of all that Marxist theory has so far recognized as part of the State Apparatus – the repressive institution through which ruling class maintains its rule as such. Althusser calls it 'Repressive State Apparatus'. He defines it as

"The State Apparatus contains: the Government, the Administration, the Army, the Police, the Court, the Prison, etc, which constitute what I shall in future call the Repressive state Apparatus. Repressive suggests that the State Apparatus in question 'functions by violence'. -at least." (Ferreter, 2006).

On the other hand, Althusser argues that State also comprises of what he calls the 'Ideological State Apparatuses'³⁶. These apparatuses are like a soft coup. People remain unfamiliar with their working. Althusser categorizes these apparatuses as the religious ISA, the family ISA, the legal ISA, the political ISA, the trade union ISA, the communication ISA (press, radio, the television), the cultural ISA (literature, arts and sports) as maintain (Ferreter, 2006). The basic difference between the Repressive State Apparatus and Ideological State Apparatus is that the Repressive state Apparatus functions primarily 'by violence' and is implemented by force, whereas the Ideological State Apparatus functions primarily 'by ideology' as maintain by (Ferreter, 2006).

3. Repressive State Apparatus in *The Shadow of Crescent Moon*

Fatima Bhutto divulges a plenty of tactics devised by state to quell the people of Mir Ali and their quest and struggle for freedom. In the very first page of the book, there is presence of army to crush any sort of insurgency or any effort to stage protest. Snipers are "on the roofs of the town's buildings, snipers lie in their nests, surrounded by sandbags, their military rain ponchos cold and clammy against their necks, and wait for the day to begin" (Bhutto, 2016). Army is not willing to recruit cadets from this region as "He thought they might take him out of Mir Ali and into one of their cadet colleges. Two things happened. First, he was turned down. The army didn't want men from these parts; they didn't even have a recruitment office in Mir Ali" (Bhutto, 2016). This shows that they are not given a platform to serve to country. Its aim is not make cognizant of their rights. In Mir Ali, first movement for freedom was launched when Inayat, father of Aman Erum, was young. Inayat narrates his story to his son that how state aggressively followed them and fizzled out their anti-state activities. State asks them to join the national horizon and mainstream of Pakistan, but when they are in, Army is asked to eliminate anti-nation elements. Then army, as a state apparatus, is shown to gear up an operation against the insurgents that is jotted down as "thousands of them, in convoys of armored vehicles, weighed down with garlands of assault weapons and hand grenades, flooded into Mir Ali. They came in conquering battalions and in plain clothes" (Bhutto, 2016). Aman Erum recalls the ruthless strategies adopted by Army against the natives of Mir Ali. She reminds as

³⁵ A religious sect in Islam

³⁶ A type of apparatus devised by state to overpower its masses, it is firstly highlighted by Louis Althusser

"Doors were broken down in the dead of night, men were kidnapped from their streets, women were widowed and children were orphaned to teach the town it's most important lesson: there was no match for the ruthlessness of the state. Another generation of male warriors would not grow in Mir Ali" (Bhutto, 2016).

Here, narrator suggests that army seems to launch a full scale war against its own people to suppress the feelings of suppressed people through repression. While narrating the past barbaric acts of state, Inayat also anticipates that "The state would begin to fight its own", and "they gave life to our insurgency" (Bhutto, 2016). And his anticipation comes true according to narrator as "Town by town, civil wars were lit by the wide-scale violence of the army – a violence that spanned decades and finally reached its zenith in the War on Terror. Swat, Bajaur, Deer, Bannu³⁷.... One by one they all rose up against the state" (Bhutto, 2016). People of Fata are not only quelled by Pakistani forces but also by American and NATO forces and by their drone attacks. Drones always fly in the airs of Fata and hit whenever they want, devoid of thinking about any innocent deaths. When Aman Erum is in USA embassy, he listens to news, "*Fourteen killed as USA predator drones strikes in North West Fronteir Province village of Bannu*" (Bhutto, 2016). Army vigorously searches people, who are involved in the anarchy and rebellion, without any delay and discrimination. Fatima Bhutto enunciates the army raids as "the army was both an invisible and an omnipresent force in Mir Ali. On the mornings of important religious holidays, you could hear their armored vehicles squeeze through the bazaar, parking themselves at busy intersections, searching the dedicated throngs just in case. Their boots left large footprints outside the houses they entered in the late hours of the night, dragging out suspected militants to be interrogated at General Headquarters" (Bhutto, 2016).

Bhutto unveils the atrocities that army exercises to wipe out the student's right to protest. Army applies unconstitutional and illegal ways to curtail the power of freedom of expression of the student of un-named university, located in Mir Ali. Many of professors work as spooks, who "are paid by the state to report on the subversive activities on their campus and in the classrooms" and "are asked to report on student who express separatist views, on those who talk freely about their fathers' travel" (Bhutto, 2016). Teachers, as fugitives of state, use to ask questions that show the behavior of students; either they are with Pakistan or not. It is jotted down on black board as "What does Pakistan mean to you? An essay on patriotism handed out during an English literature lesson" (Bhutto, 2016). If a student's answer is different from the rest of the class "it means entirely different for the pupil and his family" (Bhutto, 2016). This illustrates that state can use any tactic to repress the people or to nip the protest before it is staged. Abduction of an innocent citizen is a minor thing for army. In this context, one can say that state institution is also involved in missing person case. It is enunciated as "*Askari*³⁸ disappearances. It was a service, Inayat had said, like terminate extermination or pest control. The army had, of course, taken men and held them without warrants before , for week or even a few months" (Bhutto, 2016). She further argues that "the army for its part, has been not so quietly disappearing men across its three border provinces – never from the centre – for the better part of the past five years" (Bhutto, 2016). However, army's reaction is harsh when locals hold placards against the abduction of their relatives. In University³⁹, students launch a protest against the disappearance of a student Azmaray whose photo was published in a local paper protesting against the death of his elder brother under army's detention. "Azmaray had been photographed at a rally, a demonstration in the growing slums of Haji Abdullah Shirazi Khan road, holding a photograph of his brother , who had been disappeared by the armed forces" (Bhutto, 2016). Azmaray's brother, a professor of Political science was captured by *Khakhi*⁴⁰ men. After some days, his dead body was thrown in a local bazaar. He was detained due his freedom of expression because Azmaray's brother, Balach, was considered to be "a known firebrand. He had printed a pamphlet, a charge sheet, detailing Pakistan's crimes against its people. East Pakistan, Baluchistan, Sindhis, Pashtuns, Ahmedis, the minorities. Balach had named them all" (Bhutto, 2016). State's heinousness does not end here. It fosters its oppression upon people by its other state apparatus; the Police. After the disappearance of Balach, his father visits local police station to register the case about his son's abduction. He is denied and asked to come after a week. Balach's father does visit after a week but he is behaved rudely as police officer lashes out, "Nothing to do with us. Go sort out your personal issues on your own. We're

³⁷ Districts of Khyber Pakhtunkhaw

³⁸ Urdu word for army

³⁹ An unnamed university in Mir Ali

⁴⁰ Urdu word for a soldier

not a bloody complaint centre," (Bhutto, 2016). This reflects that all sorts the apparatuses are subjected to gain all the aims directed by state. Also, it shows that citizens will be severed from his family, if they go against the narrative of state and ask for their rights.

After the disappearance of Azamaray, three days later, his body was found in the middle of the small university campus.

"His gut was bloated. His left arm, broken onto five different places, was twisted above his shoulder. His right arm, the one that had been holding the photograph of his brother, the junior professor, lay several feet away from the place where Azmaray's body was found. His teeth had all been removed from his jawbone" (Bhutto, 2016).

Samarra is kidnapped by Army under the suzerainty of Col.Tariq, the only officer whose name is mentioned in the novel, as "they swooped in on Samarra with the delicacy of fireflies". And, "before she understood what was happening she had been lifted off the ground" (Bhutto, 2016). During the detention, Samarra also faces duress and physical torture. "He pressed his boot against her cheekbone and waited for her to talk but she kept silent." (Bhutto, 2016). Fatima Bhutto states the excessive involvement of state in the affairs of residents of Mir Ali as "They will have put their fingers everywhere, even on the ground on which we stand and the fibers through which we weave our stories" (Bhutto, 2016). It tells us that the whole community is under the supervision of army and state.

4. Ideological State Apparatus

On the basis of Ideological State Apparatus, trade was also high jacked by military, a state tentacle, in Mir Ali. Fatima Bhutto narrates "A way out of the carpet business the family had struggled in for decades – and which was now endangered because of the halting of trade routes and army's insistence on being given a share in the transportation of rugs across the Northern Frontiers" (Bhutto, 2016). State is not involved in any productive activity to relieve the people from the sense of deprivation and marginalization. Fatima Bhutto hints that state alienates people of Mir Ali and marks them as a set of marginalized people. The whole region is regarded as a numb area of schmucks by other Pakistanis. They consider the folks of Mir Ali as traitors⁴¹. As "most Pakistanis thought of Mir Ali with the same hostility they reserved for India or Bangladesh; Insiders – Traitors- who fought their way out of the body" (Bhutto, 2016). First, Aman Erum faces marginalization when he goes to Islamabad⁴² to get visa for the USA. He faces severe criticism of Punjabi Driver⁴³ as "Hundreds of *Jawan* ⁴⁴– thousands – how many of our men have spilled their blood fighting you terrorist?" (Bhutto, 2016). Then driver lashes out as, Well, let me tell you, blood will have blood. You traitors – you traitors think we don't hear your music. That we don't understand the words to the songs you sing to each other. We do. We know all the words to your traitors' song (Bhutto 28).

At international level, Pakistan declares itself as a front-foot ally of the USA against War on Terror⁴⁵ that is being fought in Pakistan-Afghanistan border. In *The Shadow of the Crescent Moon*, it is stated as "President Obama says that his country will strike terror wherever its tentacles appear. Pak President approves operation, confirms alliance to remain strong" (Bhutto, 2016). Aman Erum also has to hide his ideological concept about Twins Tower attack in the USA. When he goes to embassy to get visa, he is expected to answer the questions such as "You are with us or against us" (Bhutto, 2016). Such questions, on ideological basis, swivel the mind of Aman Erum and he, devoid of knowing anything, replies that he is with them. He is suppressed ideologically because he forgets about the ideology of his region and home. In order to get studies in USA, he accepts conditions imposed by State. He becomes a spook who always shares information with Col. Tariq, a secret agency officer. He informs his handler about every action that is going to happen in Mir Ali. He shares secrets about his brother, Hayat, who joins insurgent band. Fatima states, "Aman Erum's information had been too direct, too good. It had to have been coming from the source. He handed over too many half names which led them to many otherwise hidden men" (Bhutto, 2016). He also betrays his beloved, Samarra, by sharing

⁴¹ For further information see, Bhutto 18

⁴² Capital of Pakistan

⁴³ Taxi driver belongs to Punjab

⁴⁴ Urdu word for soldier

⁴⁵ War launched by the USA and Western powers against terrorist organization

information about her activities with Col. Tariq. All such acts illustrate that the state is dominant over its masses on ideological basis. It does not allow its citizens to think freely or do something according to their own will. The elements that try to reinforce this ideology were, once, 'Strategic Assets'⁴⁶ of state. They are Taliban who want to implement their own version of Islam. Such implementations, therefore, sideline the minorities and other small sects. Such acts give people a sense of marginalization. As it is ascribed by Bhutto that "religion crept into the town's rocky terrain like the wild flowers that grew quietly where ought not to have grown, you chose your mosque carefully" (Bhutto, 2016). So, religion has been inculcated in the landscape of Mir Ali that is ensued in form of stringent control of religious organizations. These organizations reinforce their own ideology in locality. Hence, forcing other people not to follow their own ideology. For this purpose, they ambush and put a vigorous question session before people. These circumstances are faced by Sikander and his wife, Mina⁴⁷. This couple is adversely affected by non-state actor's actions as well as by polices of state. Non-state actors, Talibans, are sprawling in Mir Ali. They have established their own checkpoints where they enquire about the faith of people. If they find someone deviating from their ideology, he/she is gunned down.

In chapter 17th of *The Shadow of the Crescent Moon*, Sikander and his wife are on the way to home, there are stopped by Talibans on the road. They have to answer the following questions as raised by Taliban leader.

"Are you a Muslim?"

"You are a man of faith"

"You fold your arms when you pray".

Do you pray three times a day "(Bhutto 172-174).

Then finally he asks, "Are you Sunni or Shia"⁴⁸, (Bhutto 174)

These questions reflect the dominance of Sunni Ideology. And the hawkish followers of this particular ideology do not permit others to follow anti-Sunni ideology. So, minorities are also quelled by the non-state actors. They are not free to go their mosques and there are hammered by ruling elite. All these evidences illustrate state's role in the violation of every right of people. It tortures, both physically and mentally, its people to not take part in any subversive activity. On political horizon, people of Fata do not have any proper representation. In *The Shadow of the Crescent Moon*, narrator shows that people are not allowed to choose their representatives. Even dwellers of Mir Ali cannot contest for an election. It is a tactic to suppress the idea of free will of people. It is termed as political ideological state apparatus by Louis Althusser, maintain by Ferretr and Luke (81). State of Pakistan does not put its machinery to work for the welfare of FATA people. It is jotted down in the text as "Next, the state opened up small ministries, the most corrupt ones where no effort was expanded and no work ever accomplished – the Ministry of Health" (Bhutto 148). Political activities are expressed in the *Express Tribune* ⁴⁹as "various party leaders indicated that political agents, the security establishment and militants were all responsible for restricting them from operating freely in Fata for election campaigns. They stated intelligence agencies regularly intimidate them and their political workers". This reflects that everything is in the hands of army and it does not allow others to implement their will. Chief Minister is depicted as puppet of state that does not have any sympathy and concern with inhabitants of Mir Ali, North Waziristan. His status is shown of "a political appointee; he had never won an election in his life" (Bhutto, 2016). Being a political appointee, he is the representative of State not people. So, he preaches the state's narrative. He always depicts the things via 'Lens of National Interest' instead of taking care about the rights of people. He holds press conferences devoid of providing any realistic facets. He states, "that will once and for all time end militancy in Mir Ali is development and reconciliation." (Bhutto, 2016). His secretaries assure him that "people there wanted nothing more than to be a part of Pakistan's future" (Bhutto, 2016). The narrative of local people is manipulated by suppressing their right of choosing a representative. Chief Minister says that pilot project⁵⁰, a project to recruit cadets from Mir Ali, will recruit thousands of men from Mir Ali and women possibly, serving in the national army. But, in reality, "the military had no such plans, no such five-year promises, but the minister drew great applause from the suggestion that they might." (Bhutto, 2016). Dwellers of Mir Ali

⁴⁶ Term coined for military breed Taliban

⁴⁷ For further information, see Bhutto 171

⁴⁸ Two major sect in Islam

⁴⁹ Express Tribune March 16, 2013

⁵⁰ A project by army to recruit cadets from Mir Ali

resist against the will of state according to their own capacity because no one can bear sufferings and cruelty for limitless time. So, people of Mir Ali repudiate against inequitable attitude and do resist for their basic and fundamental rights. They resist either verbally or practically resulting combats with armed forces. In Mir Ali, struggle for freedom began right after 1947. Inayat, father of Aman Erum, also combats against Pakistan army in many skirmishes. "Inayat had fought in first battle of Mir Ali in 1950s, and had survived. He had fought amongst the bravest, against the nervous young soldiers of Pakistan Army. He raised his young sons on the stories of Mir Ali's Struggle" (Bhutto, 2016). Inayat is inculcating the ideas of resistance in the minds of his sons as

"Mir Ali would fight. Everything we in Mir Ali know about our lives will have to change. We will teach our children to live with curfews and mid-night raids, prepare the elderly for moves at three in morning, abandoning our homes and possessions. Each and every member of the household will know that pain of no consequence when fighting for the collective" (Bhutto, 2016).

5. Resistance by People

People, from the very beginning, are resisting the forces of state and are not willing to capitulate. Parents in Mir Ali grow up their children in the name of hatred against the atrocities of state and army. They want their offspring to confront army at every level till the freedom of Mir Ali. Thus, the whole region starts fighting against the unfair rules of state. They not only fight but they are here to die for Mir Ali, "But not welcomed the honour to fight, to die, for Mir Ali" (Bhutto, 2016). Hayat and Samarra resist against the atrocities of Pakistani State and Pakistan Army by organizing an armed band to launch attacks upon state institutions. They just want to get freedom from Pakistan and set insurgent camp in university from where they handle subversive activity. Hayat "is widely acknowledged, a superior operator in the Mir Ali underground. He has moved weapons, even heavy artillery, under the eyes of military, taking rocket launchers through the every checkpoint they were to target. He has lured young military cadets to their death" (Bhutto, 2016). He is so ambitious in the accomplishment of his father's un-ended task that he commences to fight against state. He and his cadres do not fight for landscape; they do combat for their ideology, culture and life-style. Hayat does hate everything related to army. Once he reads something relevant to army and against insurgents, he "faces away from the poster" (Bhutto, 2016). Idea of freedom has been imbedded in the mind of Hayat as his father says to him "Come to my grave and tell me Mir Ali is free. Whisper it to me, even when I'm gone" (Bhutto, 2016).

Resistance is not only launched by the male strata of society but female are also on the forefront of this movement. Idea of resistance sparks in Samarra's mind after the disappearance of her father and she shows resistance against the police of state and army. She tells Hayat that "We don't operate like that. We give them fair warning" (Bhutto, 2016). This depicts that all and sundry in Mir Ali are ready to launch a resistance movement against the barbaric acts of state such as Samarra and her father. In chapter 12th of *The Shadow of the Crescent Moon*, Samarra briefs Hayat about the operation that she is going to launch. She seems in a state of jubilation as she says that "It's the biggest we have ever attempted". "It will change the situation. It will be too large an assault. They will have to refigure everything. Every security, every informer, every policy will be unmade by it" (Bhutto, 2016).

Samarra becomes rude and inflexible when she is behaved like an animal by army officer. Her repartees are, "I know that you are the ones who have sold everything in this country you defend so urgently. You sold its gold, its oil, its coal, and its labours. I know you are the first in there sixty-six years of your great country's history to have sold its skies. What have you left untouched?" (Bhutto, 2016). Samarra and Hayat plan to kill chief minister by suicide bombing. They prepare, Nasir⁵¹, for this purpose. Hayat says to Samarra to clinch the life of chief minister as "you're ready for your life to be taken with the Chief Minister's" (Bhutto, 2016). Samarra gives a fined and properly arranged plan of killing Chief Minister as "Nasir will be there, holding a camera, replacing a cameraman who never made it from the capital. All the press today has been parachuted in – no local media outlet passed security clearance- but Nasir is a last minute necessity. He has a Peshawar identity card and will be cleared by major channel whose presenter is unable to simultaneously operate the machinery and narrate the day's proceedings" (Bhutto, 2016). Masses, dejected by state's malicious acts, plan to assault the representative of state and

⁵¹ A male but voice-less character in novel

want to show their hatred against state. However, at the end their plan meets with abortive-success when Aman Erum, psychological slave of state, share apprise with army. Confrontation between army and students of university happens when dead body of Azmaray was found at university campus, and students and staff protested against this barbaric act of state. Army enters in university to disperse the mob but they face resistance. "That afternoon the army came and fired into the crowds. The fighter among the students, those who were leading their own underground cadres of poets and engineers, fired back. They killed the seven soldiers." (Bhutto, 2016). People resist according to their own capacity. Some resist in way of retaliation but some resist ideologically. Mina, who suffers from psychological disorder due her son's demise, does not want to listen to Pakistani renowned singer. She pulls the cassette out of the tape recorder by saying, "Now we listen to their musicians? To their women who sang morale-lifting paeans to soldiers? Whose tape is this? I won't have it here, I won't" (Bhutto, 2016). It helps to understand that people of other regions are aware of the reality that 'Central Province'⁵² is usurper due to military generals and political elite. People of Mir join anti-state groups due to army's unbearable torture. They can only resist by joining militias as "They were easily recruited by militias who lived in the forests and hills, waging their own bloody war against the state. Truth to be told, they were the easiest. They were easily recruited because they had nothing left to defend" (Bhutto, 2016). It vindicates that if state does not work for the welfare of its masses, they will join terrorist organizations. It is also seen in Pakistan that some young men whose families are no more due to state's War on terror join Al-Qadia and Talibans⁵³. Then they attack in the form of suicide bombers. This is vividly reflected by Fatima Bhutto in *The Shadow of the Crescent Moon*. It is reflected that people of Mir Ali strive for freedom and do not care for any loss of life. They are always prepared to confront state as, "People prepared for change, for a reversal of forces and fortune, only to be beaten back harder, more viciously, as punishment for their daring". And, "they waited for one insurgency to pass and for another to take its place. With each battle for Mir Ali they held hope aloft and waited for the moment they would be free" (Bhutto, 2016). If state uses brutality and cruelty to suppress people and to bottle neck their rights, they will resist at every cost. They would not rebuff state's stance ideologically but also come on confrontation against the state's use of power.

6. Conclusion

Fatima Bhutto provides a literary platform to the people of FATA and gives them a proper representation in literature. Bhutto's *The shadow of the Crescent Moon* is the voice of voiceless people. Image of the hapless life of the dwellers of Mir Ali depicts their *modus Vivendi* under the threat of war, the war that is launched by others and is fought against others. She tries to prove that the people of Mir Ali are deliberately marginalized due the inequitable, unjust and unfair policies as well as the myopic vision of the stake-holders of Pakistan. The implementation of the myopic and short-sighted policies is done with force e.g. by using military or police or sometimes it involves the abduction of individuals as is depicted in *The Shadow of the Crescent Moon*. These acts of force and cruelty by state cause the sharp decline in state's writ and people begin not to accept these steps. People start to protest for their fundamental rights like freedom of expression and freedom to go to their worship places. After the constant denial by state to accept masses' rights, state becomes ruthless and confrontations happen between people and state. The repercussions of these confrontations ignite the feeling of freedom as is reflected in the novel. The failure of state policies push people into the abysmal bottom of marginalization. People of the other areas of Pakistan consider the people of Mir Ali as terrorists because they have a point that residents of Mir Ali are keep on fighting against Pakistan Army. However, this is not reality. In *The Shadow of the Crescent Moon*, it is reflected that state deliberately involves in the using of state apparatuses to get its malicious gains. For this purpose, state considers itself as a higher and unchallengeable authority. No one in the country can take stand against its writ. No one is allowed to stage a protest against the will of state. If people want to get fundamental rights, they are suppressed by using brutal force. Only those are permitted to survive who not only give up their quest for their rights but also stand shoulder to shoulder with state's will. Only state has power to use 'Repressive State Apparatus'. Meanwhile, 'Ideological State Apparatuses' are also used in *The Shadow of the Crescent Moon* as a tactic to encircle the people. FATA is marginalized not only by state but is also a soft target for terrorist organization. They are between the devil and deep sea. If they come towards the state they have to accept the stringent and draconian laws for living. If they show propensity towards the Taliban, their future, most probably, is not

⁵² Stands for Punjab, for further see Bhutto 124

⁵³ Islamic militant organizations

in secured hands. So, state must replace ruthless rules with the equitable policies and also allow them to contribute in the mainstream narrative of country. Tactics used by state to get its aims are illegal as well as unethical. It is vindicated that behaving ruthlessly with its own people, as Pakistani state behaves with the people of FATA, results in anarchy, chaos and terrorism. So, it is suggested that state must behave like a mother and negotiate with people instead of preferring to use force. State must prefer table talks whenever someone misunderstands its narrative and must give up the military option.

References

- Althusser, L. (1970). Philosophy as a revolutionary weapon. *New Left Review*(64), 3.
- Bangash, S. (2016). The frontier tribal belt: genesis and purpose under the Raj. (*No Title*).
- Bhutto, F. (2016). *The shadow of the crescent moon*: Penguin Books.
- Davenport, C. (2007). *State repression and the domestic democratic peace*: Cambridge University Press.
- Ferreter, T., & Luke, S. . (2006). Louis Althusser. *London: Taylor and Francis Routledge*.
- Lieven, A. (2012). *Pakistan: A hard country*: PublicAffairs.
- Rehamn, Z. (2015, April 10). Governing Fata: The big debate - Pakistan. Retrieved from <https://www.dawn.com/news/1117447>
- Siddiqa-Agha, A. (2007). *Military Inc: Inside Pakistan's Military Economy*: Pluto Press.