Parenting and Self-Criticism among Offspring: A Systematic Review

Mafia Shahzadi[1], Rabia Khawar[2], Shazia Habib[3], Mehwish Jabeen[4]

[1] Government College University Faisalabad, Pakistan. Email: mafia.mahak@yahoo.com
[2] Professor, Government College University Faisalabad, Pakistan. Email: rabiakhawar@gcuf.edu.pk
[3] Government College University Faisalabad, Pakistan. Email: shaziahabib@gcuf.edu.pk
[4] University of Management and Technology, Pakistan. Email: mehwishjabeeen@gmail.com

ARTICLE INFO

ABSTRACT

Self-criticism involves negatively evaluating oneself and being critical of self-contemplations, beliefs, and actions, leading to dysfunction. Studies suggest that parenting plays a role in an individual's level of self-criticism. As primary caregivers, parents greatly influence their children's well-being, humility, distress, and self-criticism. To assess this relationship, a systematic review was conducted using various databases from 2003 to 2019. Out of 47 articles identified, 10 were excluded based on their abstracts and titles, and 23 were excluded after full-text assessment. The remaining 17 articles showed a significant association between parenting and self-criticism, with parental rejection being a stronger predictor of intense self-criticism. The systematic review identified limitations in the included studies' variables and outcomes, internal limitations, and a small number of research papers. To address these limitations, future studies should explore the relationship between parenting styles and self-criticism in different dimensions and investigate potential moderating factors such as environmental, psychological, and biological factors. Identifying such factors is crucial for developing effective prevention and intervention efforts to help adolescents manage their self-criticism and related mental health issues. In practical terms, the findings of the systematic review highlight the importance of parents, educators, and mental health professionals being mindful of how parenting styles may affect children's development of self-criticism. To reduce the risk of self-criticism and improve adolescents' emotional well-being, promoting positive parenting styles and behaviors, as well as identifying potential moderating factors, could be beneficial.

Corresponding Author's Email: mafia.mahak@yahoo.com

1.   Introduction

Self-criticism is an aspect of personality categorized by negative self-evaluation and a high degree of harsh self-scrutiny (Osorio & González-Cámara, 2016). Self-criticism is a tendency in which individuals critically evaluate their own beliefs, actions, and thoughts that may lead to dysfunction. People who engage in self-criticism are usually aware of the difference between their actual and desired outcomes and have a low tolerance for personal failure (Pinquart, 2016). Just as everything in the world serves a purpose, self-criticism also has its own purpose. The purpose of self-criticism is to acknowledge and reveal one's errors and weaknesses (Whelton, & Greenberg, 2005). Individuals who engage in self-criticism often exhibit introverted behavior, and negative thinking, and may have a strained relationship with their parents. Research by Shaher in 2004 suggests that self-criticism significantly affects one's level of happiness. Self-criticism is often considered a component of vulnerability to depression. Whelton and Greenberg (2005) noted that those with high levels of self-criticism often experience intense feelings of shame and find it difficult to alleviate their self-critical thoughts. In brief, individuals who engage in self-criticism tend to concentrate on negative perspectives of their life and feedback. Additionally, various studies have suggested that self-criticism is a significant factor in a range of mental health issues. Research has also indicated that self-criticism may arise from inadequate

parenting styles or parental rejection (Mol & Bus, 2011). Research has shown that during early adolescence, individuals from lower socioeconomic backgrounds, lower educational and occupational status, and those experiencing maladjustment within their family, broken families, and abnormal parenting styles are more likely to develop higher levels of self-criticism later in life (Pinquart, 2016).

The growing body of literature on self-criticism and parenting styles suggests that individuals may develop the tendency towards self-criticism as a result of their upbringing (Pinquart, 2016). Research on self-criticism and parenting styles indicates that an individual's tendency towards self-criticism may be shaped by their upbringing (Obiunu, 2018). Research has provided evidence that parenting styles have a significant impact on the development of both positive and negative emotions (Shahar et al., 2006). Baumrind's research identified four types of parenting styles: uninvolved, authoritarian, authoritative, and permissive (Soenens et al., 2008). The uninvolved style, characterized by providing less attention, and the authoritative style, characterized by providing more attention, are the most commonly studied parenting styles (Baumrind, 1971). The parenting style coined as "just right" by Baumrind is normally referred to as authoritative parenting. It comprises a well-adjusted method that contains an adequate level of expectations placed on the child and a high level of responsiveness from the parents. Authoritative parents mainly apply positive reinforcement and employ disciplinary methods cautiously (Joseph & John, 2008). Research findings unswervingly validate the benefits of authoritative parenting over the disproportionately strict authoritarian style or the overly lenient permissive style. Children raised by authoritative parents be likely to display higher levels of competency, mental well-being, and social development compared to those from permissive, authoritarian, or neglectful households (Turel, Liu, & Bart, 2017).

Moreover, parenting approaches influence the temperament of both children and parents, with two key approaches being behavioral control and acceptance, as noted by (Gittins & Hunt, 2019). Authoritarian parenting, described by Pinquart (2016), involves controlling and regulating children's behavior, which can lead to negative emotions such as distress and self-criticism (Osorio & González-Cámara, 2016). In contrast, permissive parenting focuses on positive, non-punitive behavior towards children, leading to enhanced emotional intelligence (Goodnow, Goodnow, & Collins, 1990). However, studies have also shown negative outcomes of permissive parenting, including self-criticism and antisocial behavior (Frost, Marten, Lahart, & Rosenblate, 1990; Patterson & Gullion, 1968). Uninvolved parenting, as described by Cozolino (2002), results in detached behaviors and feelings of inferiority in children, leading to aggression, antisocial behavior, and self-criticism. On the other hand, the authoritative parenting style, characterized by balanced demands on children and parental responsiveness, relies on positive reinforcement and infrequent use of punishment, leading to higher levels of competence, mental health, and social development in children, and lower levels of self-criticism (Rinaldi & Howe, 2012; Turel et al., 2017).

The aim of this systematic review is to provide a comprehensive analysis of the relationship between parenting and self-criticism in offspring. This study will achieve this by (1) providing a detailed description of parenting styles and discussing their different types, (2) focusing specifically on the connection between parenting styles and self-criticism, and (3) incorporating research conducted in countries across various income levels, including low, middle, and high-income nations. The primary objective is to examine the correlation between parenting and self-criticism, while the secondary objective is to explore how the effects of parenting on self-criticism may differ across country income levels, age groups, settings, and study quality.

2. Method and Material

This study specifically examined empirical research published within the last 17 years, with no emphasis on studies that were published prior to 2003.

2.1. Search Strategy

The current investigation conducted an exhaustive exploration for relevant literature in various databases, including Scopus, MEDLINE, Web of Science, PsycINFO, Google Scholar, Science Direct, PubMed, and OvidSP, covering the period from 2003 to 2019. The search was limited to English language studies involving human participants of adolescent age. An updated search was performed from June to September 2022.

2.2. Search Terms

The keywords or search terms were: 1) "self-critical*" OR "self-critic*" OR "Inner-critic*" OR "Negative think*" OR "Negative self-statements*" OR "self-Judge*" OR "self-attitude*" OR "attitude*" toward self. AND 2) "parenting style*" OR "parenting*" OR "parents' behavior*" OR "parents' relationship*" OR "parents' operation* OR "parenting practices" * OR "parenting styles" *, OR "parental. AND 3) "Offspring", OR *"children"*, OR *"young"*, OR *"adolescents"*, OR "adults".

2.3. Steps in Systematic Review Process

In this systematic review these are the following steps which were used;

- Conduct a thorough examination for existing reviews/protocols,
- Formulate your research question,
- Establish specific criteria for inclusion and exclusion,
- Conduct a comprehensive search to locate relevant studies,
- Apply pre-defined criteria to select studies for inclusion,
- Extract relevant data from the included studies,
- Evaluate the risk of bias associated with the included studies,
- Present the findings and assess the quality of evidence.

2.4. Inclusion and Exclusion Criteria

The current review included only those studies which met the following criteria:

- Articles published in English
- Studies that assessed parenting and self-criticism among offspring (Children, adolescents, and adults).
- Both qualitative and quantitative researches were included

In contrast, these studies were excluded if;

- Not have complete access.
- Other than English (language).
- Sample comprised non-humans, gays, or lesbians not included

2.5. Selection Process

At first, the retrieved references from the search were imported into EndNote and afterward into Excel. The selection involved look over the titles and abstracts, followed by assessing the full articles for eligibility according to the set inclusion and exclusion criteria. The selection procedure is visually portrayed in Figure 1.

3. Data Extraction

All studies were manually coded, and data such as gender, sample size/description, participants' age, study country, parenting assessment, study type/design, parenting styles, and self-criticism level were extracted (where available) from each study. The four parenting styles, namely *indulgent, authoritative, authoritarian*, and *neglectful*, were coded by the researcher. These styles were taken into account, along with the other articles extracted for this review. Only the studies that used the self-criticism scale were included, while the rest of the articles were excluded. This review completely focused on exploring the correlation between parenting and self-criticism.

3.1. Quality Assessment

The studies were evaluated using a checklist to assess their methodological quality, as well as to identify any potential threats to internal and external validity. The review utilized specific criteria to assess each study, including descriptive issues, study population, data collection, generalizability, study completion, data analysis, and interpretation.

3.2. Information Analysis

The studies on parenting, depression, psychological problems, and self-criticism were limited to non-clinical samples in this review. Each study's results were analyzed separately and categorized based on the relationship between constructs, such as the correlation between parenting styles and self-criticism, the mediation and moderation roles of psychological problems

among offspring. Treatment and intervention-based studies of self-criticism were excluded from this review.

3.3. Result

A total of 47 articles were initially retrieved from electronic databases. Upon screening the titles and abstracts, ten papers were excluded from this review. In the full-text assessment, 23 additional articles were excluded for not meeting the inclusion criteria. Finally, the complete texts of the remaining 17 articles were studied, as presented in Table 1. The conclusions align with past research that suggests a growing trend of self-criticism among individuals, with parenting style, depression, and other mental health issues playing mediating roles (Blatt & Zuroff, 1992). Some studies also examined the relationship between parenting, psychosocial stress, and self-criticism among adolescents, but a causal association was not found (Cozolino, 2002).

3.4. Study Characteristics

The researches incorporated in this review were conceded out across eight separate countries, with a prime focus on the USA (30%) and China (20%), followed by Italy, Australia, Canada, and the Netherlands (each 10%). Among the included researches, 70% used a longitudinal research design, while 30% adopted a cross-sectional design. Various instruments were used to evaluate parenting and self-criticism, with the most commonly used measures being the CRPBI, PBI, and PCS-YSR (in Studies 1, 4, 5, 7, and 9) and the DEQ (in Studies 5, 6, 9, 10, and 11). Based on the results, the review summarized the main findings into the following categories.

3.4.1. Effects of Parenting Styles

Research over the years has explored parenting practices or styles and found that there is a connection between positive parenting techniques and self-criticism among adolescents (Dunkley & Blankstein, 2000). Empirical studies have demonstrated a positive correlation between authoritative parenting and psychological well-being. Bush, Peterson, Cobas, and Supple (2002), whereas authoritarian parenting has a significant positive correlation with self-criticism (Bleys et al., 2016).

3.4.2. Parenting, Self-criticism, and Gender of the offspring

Both genders are assessed for parenting and self-criticism across various variables, including happiness, depression, non-suicidal self-injury, and more. Research studies have identified that the behaviors exhibited by both mothers and fathers exert distinct influences on the behaviors of their children.

Similarly, Research has provided evidence of the substantial influence of mothers' behavior on the self-esteem and self-criticism of their children, while fathers' behavior did not predict these outcomes for either boys or girls. Further findings revealed that fathers' support improved self-esteem in boys and reduced self-criticism in girls, whereas mothers' care reduced self-esteem in girls (Gittins & Hunt, 2019). Furthermore, an additional study revealed that females exhibited elevated levels of self-criticism and diminished levels of self-esteem in comparison to males (Cheng & Furnham, 2003). In addition, a study reported gender differences in all variables, with males scoring higher in relationships, self-esteem, and confidence, while females scored higher in variables such as self-harm and self-criticism (Ahmad & Soenens, 2010).

3.4.3. Developmental Trajectory of Self-Criticism through Parenting Styles

This systematic review focuses on how parenting styles contribute to the development of self-criticism across different age groups. Studies showed that in children, self-criticism was related to parental rejection, which eventually led to depression (Daly & Willoughby, 2019). For adolescents, perceived parental control and non-suicidal self-injury frequency were positively associated with self-criticism (You et al., 2017). Another study suggested that strict rules imposed by parents could also contribute to self-criticism in adolescents (Gittins & Hunt, 2019). However, one study indicated that a thinking style rather than perceived parental style was the source of self-criticism in adolescents (Manfredi et al., 2016). In adults, maternal care was significantly correlated with self-criticism (Cheng & Furnham, 2003), and maternal self-criticism was found to be linked to self-criticism in offspring (Bleys et al., 2016).

3.4.4. Types of Parenting Style and Self-Criticism

In this systematic review, it was found that several parenting styles can contribute to various issues, particularly self-criticism. However, there is one parenting style that has been demonstrated not to influence an individual's psychological health and self-criticism: the authoritative parenting style. Nonetheless, some studies suggest that children's life satisfaction may decrease and self-criticism may increase under the monitoring of authoritative parents (Frost et al., 1990; Pinquart, 2016).

3.4.5. Authoritarian, Permissive and Uninvolved Parenting Style leads to Self-criticism

Several studies have shown that authoritarian parenting, characterized by punishment and control, can induce a sense of sorrow, dissatisfaction, and self-criticism (Bleys et al., 2016; Manfredi et al., 2016; You et al., 2017). This suggests that authoritarian parenting styles may be linked with high levels of self-criticism and low contentment among children (Bleys et al., 2016). Similarly, permissive parenting styles have also been associated to psychological concerns such as self-criticism, as Ammerman and Brown (2018) found. This style is commonly considered unsafe for children (Pinquart, 2016). Finally, uninvolved parenting styles have also been found to have a noteworthy influence on the development of self-criticism. Studies have found that children who experience low control and low support have high probability to develop self-criticism (Cozolino, 2002), and that uninvolved parenting behaviors can lead children to feel disconnected and develop a tendency towards self-criticism (Blatt & Zuroff, 1992).

3.4.6. Authoritative Parenting Style and Self-criticism

According to this systemic review, only one parenting style, the "Authoritative Parenting Style," is positively correlated with psychological health. Research indicates that this parenting style provides a high level of support and effectively addresses children's negative emotions in a warm manner (Gittins & Hunt, 2019). Additionally, a study found that the only parenting style that resulted in positive well-being outcomes was the authoritative style, which decreased negative emotions such as sadness, depression, stress, and self-criticism (Shahar et al., 2006).

4.   Discussion

This systematic review is the most comprehensive to date and designed to explore the relationship between parenting styles and self-criticism in offspring. After screening for inclusion criteria, only 17 papers were identified across a 17-year period. The review found that authoritative parenting, which is considered a child-centered approach and high anticipations of maturity and obedience, was associated with balanced parenting. However, the review also identified a substantial link between certain parenting styles and self-criticism, with depression, internalized symptoms, and anxiety acting as mediating factors. The parenting styles examined in the review were classified into the following domains:

Firstly, researchers in the field of parenting have consistently determined that positive aspects of parenting styles have a consistent association with reduced levels of self-criticism. Moreover, studies have demonstrated that adolescents between the ages of 12 and 14 who perceive higher levels of paternal support are more inclined to develop self-confidence and exhibit lower levels of self-criticism (Garber & Flynn, 2001). Conversely, other studies have established a correlation between negative parenting behaviors and the emergence of adverse traits in children (Doyle & Markiewicz, 2005). *Secondly,* the study revealed a direct correlation between maternal self-criticism and adolescents' self-criticism, in contrast to paternal self-criticism. Moreover, the existing literature further confirms that the direct link between parental and adolescent self-criticism is either minimal or absent, as indicated by previous studies (Besser & Priel, 2005; Kopala-Sibley & Zuroff, 2014). *Thirdly*, the research encompassed in this systematic review further suggests that mothers contribute to the development of self-criticism, whereas fathers play a role in fostering self-esteem. This finding aligns with previous research that highlights the substantial influence of fathers as positive role models for children and their valuable contributions to their self-esteem (Soenens, Vansteenkiste, & Luyten, 2010).

On the contrary, this systematic review analyzed studies on self-criticism that have taken two different directions. First and foremost, certain studies propose that parents' own self-criticism can contribute to the emergence of self-criticism in their children through processes such as conditioning, identification, and observational learning *(Peng, Lam, & Jin, 2011).* In a research conducted by Shahar et al. (2006) that incorporated mothers, fathers, and daughters,

the outcomes directed that the self-criticism displayed by mothers was unambiguously associated with their daughters' self-criticism. In addition, it is proposed that parenting has a substantial influence on the development of self-criticism (Olson & Kwon, 2008). Parents' characteristics can be intrusive for their children, as they idealize them and develop a tendency for self-criticism (Okorodudu, 2010). Until now, limited research has explored the mediating role of parental psychological control in the relationship between self-criticism in parents and their children (Ahmad & Soenens, 2010; Amitay, Mongrain, & Fazaa, 2008; Soenens et al., 2008). In a study with mothers and adolescents, Ahmad and Soenens (2010) demonstrated that maternal psychological control, as reported by the adolescent, served as a mediator between mothers' and adolescents' self-criticism.

The literature suggests that parenting styles can have positive as well as negative effects on children's emotions. For instance, Cheng and Furnham (2003) found a substantial correlation between the absence of maternal care and self-criticism, with the interceding effect of low socio-economic status on this association. In parallel, other studies have examined the efficacy of specific parenting styles in fostering positive emotions. For example, Smith and Hall (2008) concluded that the authoritative parenting style is associated with fewer emotional problems and self-criticisms. Collectively, the body of research point out that parenting styles can exert a notable influence on child development, with specific significance observed during the early stages of life. Several studies, comprising cross-sectional, longitudinal, and experimental investigation (Ahmad & Soenens, 2010; Amitay et al., 2008; Kenney-Benson & Pomerantz, 2005; Koestner, Zuroff, & Powers, 1991; Soenens et al., 2008; Soenens et al., 2010), consistently validate noteworthy and reliable associations between psychologically controlling parenting and self-criticism in adolescents. These outcomes lend strong support to the above-mentioned assumptions.

In conclusion, it has been established that parenting styles have a significant impact on emotions (Bleys et al., 2016). The research also supports that parenting styles can provide significant support and responsiveness for children, but only a few parenting styles may be potentially harmful (Bleys et al., 2016). Additionally, research has shown that positive aspects of authoritative parenting are linked to better mental health outcomes and less self-criticism (Blatt & Zuroff, 1992), while authoritarian parenting is strongly associated with the trait of self-criticism compared to other parenting styles (Aniemeka, Akinnawo, & Akpunne, 2020). Hence, the available evidence substantiates the notion that parenting exerts an influence on the extent of self-criticism observed in children.

5. Conclusions

The researches propose that there is an opposite association between authoritative parenting style and behaviors for instance parental warmth, autonomy granting, and behavioral control with self-criticism. Conversely, other parenting styles, as well as parental psychological and harsh control, are linked with self-criticism in adolescents. These findings support the notion that parenting has an impact on self-criticism, with parental refusal being an important influence in strong self-criticism.

5.1 Study Limitations

This systematic review has certain limitations that require attention. First of all, the incorporated researches in this review covered a mixed variety of variables and outcomes, posing complications in making vigorous links. In addition, the internal limitations integral in each distinct study constrained the generalizability of the outcomes. Furthermore, the restricted number of studies limit the degree to which far-reaching generalizations could be drawn. To address these limits, it is recommended to conduct additional studies that explore the relationship between parenting styles and self-criticism in view of other dimensions, such as academic motivation and achievement. Moreover, exploring the link between personality type, self-criticism, and interpersonal problems among adolescents is necessary.

Furthermore, future studies should explore possible moderating factors in the relationship between parenting and self-criticism. Though the associations between parents and self-criticism were relatively uncertain, it is essential to pinpoint other environmental, psychological, and biological influences that may affect these relationships. These factors could include peer influence, early adversity, coping strategies, and susceptibility genes. Detecting such causes is

important for developing operational prevention and intervention plans for assisting children in dealing their self-criticism and related mental health issues.

5.2   Study implications

The practical implications of the systematic review are that parents can play an important part in the development of self-criticism among their children. Therefore, it is important for parents to be aware of their child-rearing approach and in what way they may have an impact on their children's emotional growth. Parents who use authoritative parenting styles and behaviors such as warmth, autonomy, and behavioral control may help their children avoid self-criticism. On the other hand, parents who use other parenting styles, such as psychological control and harsh control, may increase the risk of their children developing self-criticism.

The findings of the review also suggest that intervention efforts should be focused on identifying environmental, psychological, and biological factors that can affect the link between parenting and self-criticism. For example, peer relationships and coping strategies may play a role in moderating the association between parenting styles and self-criticism. Additionally, early adversity and susceptibility genes may also influence the relationship between parenting and self-criticism.

Overall, the practical implications of the systematic review propose that parents, educators, and mental health professionals should be aware of the potential impact of child-rearing strategies on the development of self-criticism in children. By promoting positive styles of parenting and behaviors, and identifying potential moderating factors, it may be possible to decrease the danger of self-criticism and improve the emotional wellbeing of adolescents.

References

Ahmad, I., & Soenens, B. (2010). Perceived maternal parenting as a mediator of the intergenerational similarity of dependency and self-criticism: a study with Arab Jordanian adolescents and their mothers. *Journal of Family Psychology, 24*(6), 756. doi:https://doi.org/10.1037/a0021508

Amitay, O. A., Mongrain, M., & Fazaa, N. (2008). Love and control: Self-criticism in parents and daughters and perceptions of relationship partners. *Personality and Individual Differences, 44*(1), 75-85. doi:https://doi.org/10.1016/j.paid.2007.07.020

Ammerman, B. A., & Brown, S. (2018). The mediating role of self-criticism in the relationship between parental expressed emotion and NSSI. *Current Psychology, 37*, 325-333. doi:https://doi.org/10.1007/s12144-016-9516-1

Aniemeka, O. O., Akinnawo, O. E., & Akpunne, B. C. (2020). Validation of the Schutte Self-Report Emotional Intelligence Test (SSEIT) on Nigerian Adolescents. *Journal of Education and Practice, 11*(18), 177-181. doi:https://doi.org/10.7176/jep/11-18-19

Baumrind, D. (1971). Current patterns of parental authority. *Developmental psychology, 4*(1p2), 1. doi:https://doi.org/10.1037/h0030372

Besser, A., & Priel, B. (2005). The apple does not fall far from the tree: Attachment styles and personality vulnerabilities to depression in three generations of women. *Personality and Social Psychology Bulletin, 31*(8), 1052-1073. doi:https://doi.org/10.1177/0146167204274082

Blatt, S. J., & Zuroff, D. C. (1992). Interpersonal relatedness and self-definition: Two prototypes for depression. *Clinical psychology review, 12*(5), 527-562. doi:https://doi.org/10.1016/0272-7358(92)90070-O

Bleys, D., Soenens, B., Boone, L., Claes, S., Vliegen, N., & Luyten, P. (2016). The role of intergenerational similarity and parenting in adolescent self-criticism: An actor–partner interdependence model. *Journal of adolescence, 49*, 68-76. doi:https://doi.org/10.1016/j.adolescence.2016.03.003

Bush, K. R., Peterson, G. W., Cobas, J. A., & Supple, A. J. (2002). Adolescents' perceptions of parental behaviors as predictors of adolescent self–esteem in mainland China. *Sociological Inquiry, 72*(4), 503-526. doi:https://doi.org/10.1111/1475-682X.00031

Cheng, H., & Furnham, A. (2003). Personality, self-esteem, and demographic predictions of happiness and depression. *Personality and Individual Differences, 34*(6), 921-942. doi:https://doi.org/10.1016/S0191-8869(02)00078-8

Cozolino, L. (2002). *The neuroscience of psychotherapy: building and rebuilding the human brain (norton series on interpersonal neurobiology)*: WW Norton & Company.

Daly, O., & Willoughby, T. (2019). A longitudinal study investigating bidirectionality among nonsuicidal self-injury, self-criticism, and parental criticism. *Psychiatry research, 271*, 678-683. doi:https://doi.org/10.1016/j.psychres.2018.12.056

Doyle, A. B., & Markiewicz, D. (2005). Parenting, marital conflict and adjustment from early-to mid-adolescence: Mediated by adolescent attachment style? *Journal of youth and adolescence, 34*, 97-110. doi:https://doi.org/10.1007/s10964-005-3209-7

Dunkley, D. M., & Blankstein, K. R. (2000). Self-critical perfectionism, coping, hassles, and current distress: A structural equation modeling approach. *Cognitive therapy and research, 24*, 713-730. doi:https://doi.org/10.1023/A:1005543529245

Frost, R. O., Marten, P., Lahart, C., & Rosenblate, R. (1990). The dimensions of perfectionism. *Cognitive therapy and research, 14*, 449-468. doi:https://doi.org/10.1007/BF01172967

Garber, J., & Flynn, C. (2001). Predictors of depressive cognitions in young adolescents. *Cognitive therapy and research, 25*, 353-376. doi:https://doi.org/10.1023/A:1005530402239

Gittins, C. B., & Hunt, C. (2019). Parental behavioural control in adolescence: How does it affect self-esteem and self-criticism? *Journal of adolescence, 73*, 26-35. doi:https://doi.org/10.1016/j.adolescence.2019.03.004

Goodnow, J. F., Goodnow, J. J., & Collins, W. A. (1990). *Development according to parents: The nature, sources, and consequences of parents' ideas*: Psychology Press.

Joseph, M. V., & John, J. (2008). Impact of parenting styles on child development. *Global Academic Society Journal: Social Science Insight, 1*(5), 16-25.

Kenney-Benson, G. A., & Pomerantz, E. M. (2005). The role of mothers' use of control in children's perfectionism: Implications for the development of children's depressive symptoms. *Journal of Personality, 73*(1), 23-46. doi:https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-6494.2004.00303.x

Koestner, R., Zuroff, D. C., & Powers, T. A. (1991). Family origins of adolescent self-criticism and its continuity into adulthood. *Journal of Abnormal Psychology, 100*(2), 191. doi:https://doi.org/10.1037/0021-843X.100.2.191

Kopala-Sibley, D. C., & Zuroff, D. C. (2014). The developmental origins of personality factors from the self-definitional and relatedness domains: A review of theory and research. *Review of General Psychology, 18*(3), 137-155. doi:https://doi.org/10.1037/gpr0000013

Manfredi, C., Caselli, G., Pescini, F., Rossi, M., Rebecchi, D., Ruggiero, G. M., & Sassaroli, S. (2016). Parental criticism, self-criticism and their relation to depressive mood: An exploratory study among a non-clinical population. *Research in Psychotherapy: Psychopathology, Process and Outcome, 19*(1).

Mol, S. E., & Bus, A. G. (2011). To read or not to read: a meta-analysis of print exposure from infancy to early adulthood. *Psychological bulletin, 137*(2), 267. doi:https://doi.org/10.1037/a0021890

Obiunu, R. F. D. J. J. (2018). Influence of parenting styles on the academic performance of secondary school students in Ethiope East local government area Delta State. *International Journal of Educational Technology and Learning, 2*(2), 54-58. doi:https://doi.org/10.20448/2003.22.54.58

Okorodudu, G. N. (2010). Influence of parenting styles on adolescent delinquency in delta central senatorial district. *Edo Journal of Counselling, 3*(1), 58-86. doi:https://doi.org/10.4314/ejc.v3i1.52682

Olson, M. L., & Kwon, P. (2008). Brooding perfectionism: Refining the roles of rumination and perfectionism in the etiology of depression. *Cognitive therapy and research, 32*, 788-802. doi:https://doi.org/10.1007/s10608-007-9173-7

Osorio, A., & González-Cámara, M. (2016). Testing the alleged superiority of the indulgent parenting style among Spanish adolescents. *Psicothema, 28*(4), 414-420. doi:https://doi.org/10.7334/psicothema2015.314

Patterson, G. R., & Gullion, M. E. (1968). Living with children: New methods for parents and teachers.

Peng, Z.-W., Lam, L. T., & Jin, J. (2011). Factors associated with social interaction anxiety among Chinese adolescents. *East Asian Archives of Psychiatry, 21*(4), 135-141.

Pinquart, M. (2016). Associations of parenting styles and dimensions with academic achievement in children and adolescents: A meta-analysis. *Educational Psychology Review, 28*, 475-493. doi:https://doi.org/10.1007/s10648-015-9338-y

Rinaldi, C. M., & Howe, N. (2012). Mothers' and fathers' parenting styles and associations with toddlers' externalizing, internalizing, and adaptive behaviors. *Early Childhood Research Quarterly, 27*(2), 266-273. doi:https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecresq.2011.08.001

Shahar, G., Henrich, C. C., Winokur, A., Blatt, S. J., Kuperminc, G. P., & Leadbeater, B. J. (2006). Self-criticism and depressive symptomatology interact to predict middle school academic achievement. *Journal of clinical psychology, 62*(1), 147-155. doi:https://doi.org/10.1002/jclp.20210

Smith, D. C., & Hall, J. A. (2008). Parenting style and adolescent clinical severity: Findings from two substance abuse treatment studies. *Journal of Social Work Practice in the Addictions, 8*(4), 440-463. doi:https://doi.org/10.1080/15332560802341073

Soenens, B., Luyckx, K., Vansteenkiste, M., Luyten, P., Duriez, B., & Goossens, L. (2008). Maladaptive perfectionism as an intervening variable between psychological control and adolescent depressive symptoms: a three-wave longitudinal study. *Journal of Family Psychology, 22*(3), 465. doi:https://doi.org/10.1037/0893-3200.22.3.465

Soenens, B., Vansteenkiste, M., & Luyten, P. (2010). Toward a domain-specific approach to the study of parental psychological control: Distinguishing between dependency-oriented and achievement-oriented psychological control. *Journal of Personality, 78*(1), 217-256. doi:https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-6494.2009.00614.x

Turel, O., Liu, P., & Bart, C. (2017). Board-level information technology governance effects on organizational performance: The roles of strategic alignment and authoritarian governance style. *Information Systems Management, 34*(2), 117-136. doi:https://doi.org/10.1080/10580530.2017.1288523

Whelton, W. J., & Greenberg, L. S. (2005). Emotion in self-criticism. *Personality and Individual Differences, 38*(7), 1583-1595. doi:https://doi.org/10.1016/j.paid.2004.09.024

You, J., Jiang, Y., Zhang, M., Du, C., Lin, M.-P., & Leung, F. (2017). Perceived parental control, self-criticism, and nonsuicidal self-injury among adolescents: Testing the reciprocal relationships by a three-wave cross-lag model. *Archives of suicide research, 21*(3), 379-391. doi:https://doi.org/10.1080/13811118.2016.1199989

Appendix

Table A1: Characteristic of the Studies

Title	Study Reference	Country	Study Type/Design	Sample Characteristics
Perceived paternal rearing style, self-esteem and self-criticism as predictors of happiness	Furnham,& Cheng, 2003	The Netherlands	Longitudinal	Young adults N=356, 15-25 years M_{age}= 17.62 SD= 3.89 Male=195 Female=97
Parental verbal abuse and the mediating role of self-criticism in adult internalizing disorders	Sachs-Ericsson,et al., 2006	USA	Cross-Sectional	Adolescents and Adults N=5614, 15 to 54 years M_{age}= 33.2 SD= 10.7 Male=3000 Female=2614
Family Experiences and Self-Criticism in College Students: Testing a Model of Family Stress, Past Unfairness, and Self-Esteem	Katy & Nelson, 2007	USA	Cross-Sectional	N = 98, 75 female Students' parents (n = 81, 70 mothers 11 fathers M_{age}= 48.94 SD = 4.88,
Adolescent Relations with Their Mothers, Siblings, and Peers: An Exploration of the Roles of Maternal and Adolescent Self-Criticism	Yu & Gamble, 2009	USA	Cross-Sectional	444 mothers and their older and younger adolescent sibling children. M_{age}= 40.2 SD= 6.7 A child in fifth, sixth, or seventh grade M_{age}=11.6 SD= 1.8 Older sibling M_{age}=14.3 SD= 2.1

Perceived Maternal Parenting as a Mediator of the Intergenerational Similarity of Dependency and Self-Criticism: A Study With Arab Jordanian Adolescents and Their Mothers	Ahmad,& Soenens, 2010	USA	Cross-Sectional	Adolescents N=298, 14 to 18 years M_{age}= 15 SD= 0.93 Girls=160 Boys=138
Recollections of Parental Rejection, Self-Criticism and Depression in Suicidality	Campos et al., 2013	China	Longitudinal	Adults N=200, 19 to 63 years M_{age}= 35.83 SD= 11.62 Male=104 Female=96
The relationship between parental expressed emotions and NSSI: The mediating roles of self-criticism and depression.	Baetens et al., 2015	Belgium	Cross-Sectional	358 adolescents M_{age}== 16.07 years, SD = 1.12 Male=179 Female=179
Parental criticism, self-criticism and their relation to depressive mood: An exploratory study among a non-clinical population	Manfredi, et al., 2016	Italy	Longitudinal	Adolescents and Young Adults N=194, 17- 67 years M_{age}= 35.9 Male=55 Female=139
The role of intergenerational similarity and parenting in adolescent self-criticism: An actor-partner interdependence model	Bleys, et al., 2016	UK	Longitudinal	Adolescents N=284, 12-16 years M_{age}= 14.14 SD= 0.93 Girls=184 Boys=100
Attachment styles and suicide related behaviors in adolescences: the mediating role of self-criticism and dependency	Falgares, et al., 2017	Sri Lanka	Longitudinal	Adolescents N=340, 13-20 years M_{age}= 16.47 SD= 1.52 Girls=160 Boys=180
Perceived Parental Control, Self-Criticism, and Nonsuicidal Self-Injury Among Adolescents: Testing the Reciprocal Relationships by a Three-Wave Cross-Lag Model	You, et al., 2017	China	Longitudinal	Adolescents N=2857 (Girls), 12 and 18 years M_{age}= 14.63 SD= 1.25
The Mediating Role of Self-Criticism in the Relationship between Parental Expressed Emotion and NSSI	Ammerman,& Brown, 2018	USA	Longitudinal	Adolescents and Young adults N=294, 14-18 years M_{age}= 15.97 SD= 1.22 Boys= 49 Girls=45 18 to 20 years M_{age}= 18.47 SD= .67 Male=39 Female=162 368 adolescents M_{age}= 14.5 SD= 0.65
Parental psychological control, adolescent selfcriticism, and adolescent depressive symptoms: A latent change modeling approach in Belgian adolescents	Bleys at el, 2018	Belgian	Longitudinal	After one year 295 adolescents M_{age}= 14.7 SD= 0.82
The Association Between Self-Critical Rumination and Parenting Stress: The Mediating Role of Mindful Parenting	Moreira & Canavarro, 2018	Portugal	Cross-Sectional	Adults N=265 M_{age}= 14.14 SD= 0.93
Parental behavioral control in adolescence: How does it affect self-esteem and self-criticism?	Gittins, & Hunt 2019	Australia	Cross-Sectional	Adolescents N=243 (Girls), 12 and 18 years M_{age}= 12.08 SD= 0.43
A longitudinal study investigating bidirectionality among nonsuicidal self-injury, self-criticism, and parental criticism	Daly, & Willoughby, 2019	Canada	Longitudinal	Children and Adolescents N=1132, 10-16 years

				M_{age}= 19.06

Recalled Parenting Practices and Psychological Distress in Turkish Emerging Adults: The Role of Self-Criticism — Özdemir & Sağkal, 2019 — Turkey — Cross-Sectional

M_{age}= 19.06
SD= 1.05
Girls=600
Boys=700
Undergraduate students
N=410
M_{age}=20.10 Years
SD = 1.65
Females= 290
Male= 120

Note: M_{age}=Mean Age, SD= Standard Deviation

Table A2: Assessment of Variables N=14

Sr=No	Parenting	Self-Criticism	Other Constructs	Conclusion
Study 1	PBI (Paker at el., 1979)	Self-Criticism Questionnaire (Brewin at el., 1992)	RSE (Rosenberg, 1965) & OHI (Argyle at el., 1989)	Maternal care significantly correlates with happiness rather than paternal care.
Study2	CIDI (Kessler, 2000)	DEQ (Blatt, D'Afflitti, & Quinlan, 1976)	"Dependency and Emotional Reliance on Others" scale DEROS (Hirschfeld et al., 1977).	Both self-criticism and parental verbal abuse enhance the internalizing symptoms among adults.
Study 3		LOSCS (Thompson & Zuroff, 2004) ISC & CSC	RSE (Rosenberg, 1965)	Self-esteem mediated the effects of family unfairness on both types of self-criticism.
Study 4	FRS-A (Jurkovic & Thirkield, 1998)	DEQA ((Blatt at el., 1992).	PRQ (Rigby & Slee, 1993)	Maternal self-criticism strongly corresponded to the quality of relationships with children, and an intergenerational similarity in levels of self-criticism, particularly for older children, was found.
	PCRQ (Furman & Giberson, 1995)			
Study 5	CRPBI (Schludermann, Schludermann, 1988)& PCS-YSR (Barber, 1996)	DEQ (Blatt, D'Afflitti, & Quinlan, 1976)	CES-D (Radloff, 1977)	In this study, there is a significant association between mothers' and adolescents' dependency and self-criticism.
Study 6	IAMPRB (Arrindell, & Van der Ende, 1984)	DEQ(Blatt, D'Afflitti, & Quinlan, 1976)	SBQ-R (Osman at el., 2001) CES–D (Radloff, 1977)	Parental rejection is not significantly correlate with depressive symptoms and suicidality while tendency of self-criticism and suicidality mediated by depressive symptoms.
Study 7	Level of Expressed Emotions (LEE) Dutch version: Hale, Raaijmakers, Gerlsma, & Meeus, 2007)	Self Rating Scale SRS; Hooley, Ho, Slater, & Lockshin, 2010	Brief NonSuicidal Self-Injury Assessment Tool (BNSSI -AT) Whitlock & Purington, 2007) Child Depression Inventory-Dutch version CDI-NL; Timbremont & Braet, 2002	perceived parental lack of emotional support had a direct effect on NSSI, as well as an indirect effect via depressive symptoms (mediation). The path from depression to NSSI was also mediated by self-criticism. Finally, perceived parental criticism had only an indirect effect on

				NSSI, through self-criticism.
Study 8	PCS (Hooley & Teasdale, 1989)	LOSCS (Thompson & Zuroff, 2004) ISC & CSC	BDI (Beck., at el, June) 1961) , RRS (Nolen-Hoeksema & Morrow, 1991) MPS (Frost et al., 1990)	The tendency of self-criticism is developed due to thinking style rather than a perceived parental style.
Study 9	PPC ((Soenens et al., 2010)	DEQ (Blatt, D'Afflitti, & Quinlan, 1976)		Maternal attachment and self-criticism are significantly associated with adolescents' self-criticism
Study 10	ASQ (Fossati at el., 2003)	DEQ-A (Blatt, D'Afflitti, & Quinlan, 1976)	SBQ-R (Osman at el., 2001)	It has concluded that Self-criticism mediates the link between insecure attachment and suicidal behaviors.
Study 11	PBI (Paker at el., 1979)	DEQ (Blatt, D'Afflitti, & Quinlan, 1976) 9-item Self-Criticism Subscale	NSSI (You, Leung, & Fu, 2012)	Perceived parental control and self-criticism didn't predict nonsuicidal self-injury (NSSI) but NSSI predicted parental control and self-criticism.
Study 12	LEE (Cole & Kazarian,1993)	FSCRS; (Gilbert et al. 2004)	DSHI (Gratz 2001)	The person with nonsuicidal self-injury (NSSI) perceives less parental support and expresses significant criticism as related NSSI. Furthermore, self-criticism also mediated the relation between perceived parental expressed emotion and NSSI.
Study 13	CRPBI-30 (Schludermann, Schludermann, 1988	LOSC (Thompson & Zuroff, 2004)	RSE (Rosenberg, 1965)	The high level of Parental control behavior develops greater self-criticism among girls.
Study 14	mindful parenting	self-critical rumination DEQA ((Blatt at el., 1992).	parenting stress CES-D; Radloff, 1977	This study identifies an important maladaptive psychological process (self-critical rumination) that explains individual differences in parenting and a mechanism that may account for the link between self-critical rumination and parenting stress, which can both be modified through intervention.
Study 15	AOPCS (Soenens et al., 2010)			The results underscore the importance of personality-related vulnerability in associations between the parenting environment and symptoms of psychopathology during adolescent development.

| Study 16 | PCS-YSR (Barber, 1996) | B-COPE (Carver, 1997) | ISAS (Klonsky & Glenn, 2009) | This research found a significant unidirectional relation between self-criticism and nonsuicidal self-injury. |
| Study 17 | My Memories of Upbringing— Egna Minnen Betraffande Uppfostra (Arrindell et. al, 1999) | Self Criticizing/Attacking and Self Reassuring Scale (Gilbert et al., 2004) | Depression, Anxiety, and Stress Scale (DASS; Lovibond and Lovibond, 1995) | The findings of the present study highlighted the importance of self-criticism and past memories of parenting as intervention targets to support well-being of young people. |

Note: *CRPBI-30:* Children's Reports of Parent Behavior Inventory-30, LOSC: Levels of Self-Criticism Scale, ICS: Internalized Self-Criticism , RSE: Rosenberg Self-Esteem Scale, PCS: Perceived criticism scale, RRS: Ruminative responses scale, MPS: Multidimensional perfectionism scale, PS: Personal standards, PE: Parental expectations, PC: parental criticism, D: doubts about actions, O: Organization, LEE: Levels of Expressed Emotion Scale, BDI: Beck Depression Inventory, DSHI: Deliberate Self Harm Inventory, PBI: Parental Bonding Instrument, PBI: Parent Behavior Inventory, OHI: Oxford happiness inventory, CSC: Comparative Self-criticism, DEQ: Depressive Experiences Questionnaire, DEROS: Dependency and Emotional Reliance on Others scale, PCS-YSR: Psychological Control Scale Youth Self-Report, B-COPE: Brief COPE,ISAS: Inventory of Statements About Self-injury, FSCRS: Self-Criticizing/Attacking and Self-Reassuring Scale, CRPBI: Child Report of Parent Behavior Inventory, CES-D: Center for Epidemiologic Studies Depression Scale, IAMPRB: Inventory for Assessing Memories of Parental Rearing Behavior, PCS-YSR: Psychological Control Scale -Youth Self Report, ASQ: Attachment Style Questionnaire, SCQ: Self-Criticism Questionnaire, SBQ-R, Suicidal Behavioral Questionnaire Revised, PPC: Parental Psychological Control, DEQ-A: Depressive Experiences Questionnaire for Adolescents , SBQ-R: Suicidal Behaviors Questionnaire-Revised, The Inventory of Statements About Self-injury, ISAS: The Inventory of Statements About Self-injury, DEROS: Dependency and Emotional Reliance on Others Scale", DEQA: Depressive Experiences Questionnaire– Adolescent, PCRQ: Parent– Child Relationship Questionnaire, PRQ: Peer Relations Questionnaire, AOPCS: Achievement-Oriented Psychological Control scale, CES-D: Epidemiological Studies Depression Scale, FRS-A: Filial Responsibility Scale-Adult Form

Figure A1: Flow Diagram